

**DC/2013/00474**

**A FIRST FLOOR EXTENSION TO 5 & 5A CHIPPENHAMGATE STREET TO PROVIDE A SINGLE, ONE BEDROOM DWELLING WITH THREE PARKING SPACES AT GROUND LEVEL.**

**5 & 5A CHIPPENHAMGATE STREET, MONMOUTH NP25 3D**

**RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE**

Case Officer: Jo Draper  
Date Registered: 23/06/2015

This application was presented to Planning Committee on the 5<sup>th</sup> July 2016 with a recommendation for approval; it was deferred to look at changing the contemporary materials and replacing these with more traditional materials. Also there was a requirement to provide a closer detail of the external horizontal louvres required for screening purposes.

Revised plans have been submitted and these have shown the changes requested by Planning Committee, the timber boarding proposed to the walls have been replaced with a smooth white render the main dwelling, the modern metal roof is to be replaced by a slate roof.

A section has been provided of the horizontal louvres, this has been presented as a 1:100 and 1:20 scale. The horizontal louvres have been positioned so that there can be no overlooking of the neighbouring garden to the rear.

This application is re-presented to Planning Committee with the recommendation of approval. The original report, including the conditions, is attached below for information.

## **PREVIOUS REPORT**

### **1.0 APPLICATION DETAILS**

- 1.1 The application site relates to an area that is currently used for parking for flats 5 and 5a Chippenham Gate Street. This application proposes to formalise this car parking area to provide 3 spaces to serve the existing dwellings with an additional space for the proposed dwelling. This application proposes a one bedroom flat to be constructed above the parking area.
- 1.2 The application site is bounded by Chippenham Gate Street to the north, it is adjoining a residential property to the east, and there are gardens to the south that serve a neighbouring property with a neighbouring property to the west. The north elevation is open fronted to Chippenham gate Street and allows vehicular access to the site.
- 1.3 There have been many design changes with this scheme, the existing dwelling which this proposal is also included. It is proposed to modernise this building frontage with new contemporary windows, a smooth render and the entrance treated with a modern up to date entrance point. The new build sits slightly lower in eaves and ridge to this building (0.7m lower than the ridge and eaves on the existing building). The proposed new build has a footprint that measures 9.3m by 5m, the treatment is contemporary and comprises of vertical coated aluminium windows at first floor level with horizontal timber cladding, a modern metal roof is proposed. The rear elevation has contemporary external horizontal timber louvres proposed to part of the rear of the building. This not only serves to provide privacy to the neighbouring gardens immediately to the rear but also encloses the external staircase proposed to access this first floor flat. The only window not covered by louvres is a narrow modern horizontal window that serves the kitchen/living room.

- 1.4 The site is situated within the Monmouth development boundary the Conservation Area and an Archaeologically Sensitive Area and within a Zone C1 Flood Area.

## **2.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY**

None

## **3.0 LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES**

### Strategic Policies

S1 – Spatial Distribution of New Residential Development  
S2- Housing Provision  
S4- Affordable Housing Provision  
S12- Efficient Resource Use and Flood Risk  
S13 – Landscape, Green Infrastructure and the Natural Environment  
S17 – Place Making and Design

### Development Management Policies

H1 – Residential Development in Rural Secondary Settlements  
H5 – Replacement Dwellings in the Open Countryside  
DES1 – General Design Considerations  
EP1 – Amenity and Environmental Protection  
NE1- Nature Conservation and Development  
G11-Green Infrastructure  
HE1- Development in Conservation Areas  
MV1- Proposed Development and Highway Considerations  
SD3- Flood Risk

## **4.0 REPRESENTATIONS**

### 4.1 Consultations Replies

Monmouth Town Council: Refused

- Not in keeping with the Conservation Area
- Wrong materials
- Design not in keeping with street scene

Natural Resources Wales:

The application site lies entirely within Zone C1. The site is within the 1% (1 in 100 year) and 0.1% (1 in 1000 year) annual probability fluvial flood outlines of the River Monnow, a designated main river. Our records show that the area around the proposed site has also previously flooded from the River Monnow.

We have reviewed the flood consequences assessment (FCA).

The flood levels at the site, stated in the FCA, are as follows:

- 1 in 100 year plus climate change: 18.41m AOD
- 1 in 1000 year: 19.91m AOD

The proposed finished floor level for the first floor extension is stated in the FCA as 20.08m AOD and the level for the undercroft car parking level is 17.42m AOD.

The 1 in 100 year plus climate change flood level (18.41m) is below that of the proposed habitable floor level (20.08m). Therefore, this part of the development is predicted to be flood free in the 1% plus climate change flood event as advised by A1.14 of TAN 15. It is also predicted to be flood free in the 1 in 1000 year flood event.

However, the proposed undercroft parking is predicted to flood to a depth of up to 1.0m in the 1 in 100 year plus climate change flood event, and as such is contrary to the advice at A1.14 of TAN15. The undercroft parking is predicted to flood to a depth of 2.48m during

the 1 in 1000 year flood event. This is 1.88m in excess of the indicative tolerable conditions set out at A1.15 of TAN15.

It is noted that this area is already currently used as a hard standing for car parking. Should your Authority be minded to grant permission, and as such accept the consequences of flooding, we advise that an Emergency Flood Plan is undertaken by the owner/occupier and that they sign up to our flood warning service.

MCC Highways: No objection

- The proposed new dwelling is to be attached to the adjoining dwelling and upgrading the access, parking and facilities at the side of the existing site.
- The proposed parking will be in a car port provision and three in number.
- This is the maximum number of parking places that can be provided on site.
- As this is a town location, a relaxation would be required for this development to proceed. Three spaces currently available.

Gwent Glamorgan Archaeological Trust: Recommend a condition requiring the applicant to submit a detailed programme of investigation for the archaeological resource

Welsh Water: Recommend conditions relating to surface water and land drainage

#### 4.2 Neighbour Notification

3 representations have been received, the following issues have been raised.

- Whilst no objection to an extension, the front and back elevations are entirely unsuitable for a Conservation Area.
- The proposed layout with the upper floor extension and underlying car parking area is out of character in this part of the Conservation Area.
- Inappropriate development within a group of Listed Buildings
- There is a planning history of refusals
- The ground is unstable and the existing building is structurally unsound – further building could exacerbate this problem

#### 4.3 Other Representations

None received to date

#### 4.4 Local Member Representations

None received to date

### 5.0 **EVALUATION**

5.1 The site is located within the Monmouth Town Development Boundary, the development of this site meets the requirements of Strategic Policy S1 and Policy H1 in principle subject to detailed planning considerations. The main issues that arise in the consideration of this application are the following:

Impact upon the setting of the Conservation Area  
Neighbour Amenity  
Flooding

#### 5.2 Impact upon the setting of the Conservation Area

5.2.1 This application has gone through a number of amendments before being finalised to the scheme that is now being presented to Planning Committee. The existing site does not currently enhance this part of the Conservation Area, the form, design and materials associated with the existing dwelling and the hardstanding which forms the site for the new build has little architectural merit. Therefore, it is not appropriate in the case for the extension to try and compliment or reflect the design of the existing dwelling. Indeed

Policy HE1 of the Local Development Plan states that “*Where development is acceptable in principle it should complement or reflect the architectural qualities of adjoining and other nearby buildings (unless these are harmful to the character and appearance of the area) in terms of its profile, silhouette, detailing and materials. However, good modern design may be acceptable, particularly where new compositions and points of interest are created.*”

5.2.2 The latest revised scheme now embraces the existing building, the modern proportions of the existing dwelling has resulted in the new build being contemporary in design and form with contemporary materials proposed. The existing dwelling is being given a modern facelift with clean contemporary materials and detailing used to enhance the frontage of the existing building. The resultant scheme therefore does not seek to reflect the traditional design and form of some of the surrounding dwellings, which would be inappropriate in this case, it does as a whole represent a significant improvement to the existing development and complies with Policy HE1 in this case.

### 5.3 Neighbour Amenity

5.3.1 The new development does introduce new windows at first floor level that is situated less than 21m from the first floor windows of the properties opposite. This however is characteristic of this area and reflects the built form with dwellings sited close to the road frontage, this coupled with the narrow vertical emphasis windows on both the existing neighbouring properties opposite and the proposed new development limits the viewpoints between properties. The neighbour impact is not considered to be significant in this case.

5.3.2 There is potential to immediately overlook the neighbouring gardens to the rear, this garden area is however currently overlooked from the highway as an open viewpoint can be achieved across the hardstanding area. There are three rear windows at first floor level and an external staircase that potentially increases overlooking as people can linger by the 1<sup>st</sup> floor access door and immediately overlook the garden area. This has been addressed within the design of the scheme with the provision of an external horizontal timber louver screen, this screens viewpoints from the two 1<sup>st</sup> floor windows and the upper floor landing. The only window not screened that serves the kitchen/living space is both narrow and horizontal and provides only a very limited viewpoint across into this private amenity space. The proposal has been innovative in the approach to protecting neighbour amenity and the scheme will not have an adverse impact upon neighbour amenity.

### 5.4 Flooding

5.4.1 The site is located in Zone C1 floodplain, Strategic Policy S12 and supporting development management Policy SD3 relating to Flood Risk is therefore of relevance. Strictly speaking the proposal is contrary to Policy SD3 as the residential development is located above an existing car parking area, it does not relate to the conversion of existing upper floors. It is necessary to consider whether the proposal satisfies the justification tests outlined in Welsh Government Guidance in TAN15.

5.4.2 In this respect the proposal represents a ‘windfall’ brownfield development within the existing settlement boundary that contributes to meeting the housing targets set out in LDP Policy S2 and thereby assists in achieving the objectives of the Local Development Plan strategy. Furthermore the Conservation Area Policy seeks to preserve and enhance the character or appearance of the area and its landscape setting; Where development is acceptable in principle it should complement or reflect the architectural qualities of adjoining and other nearby buildings (unless these are harmful to the character and appearance of the area). In this case the proposal improves the existing dwelling raising the standard of the existing development as a result of this proposed development and as concluded above the proposal represents a significant improvement in the overall street scene within this part of the Conservation Area, hence meeting a further LDP strategy. The proposal therefore satisfies the justification tests outlined in TAN 15. This

when balanced with the conclusions that the upper floor will not be at risk in the 1 in 1000 year flood event, with the ground floor parking area predicted to flood to a depth of 2.48m during this event which can happen now, it is acceptable to over-ride SD3 and S12 in this case. It is recommended that there is a note to applicant within the informative advising that an Emergency Flood Plan is undertaken by the owner/occupier and that they sign up to our flood warning service

6.0 Response to the Representations of the Community/ Town Council

Addressed above

**7.0 RECOMMENDATION: Approve**

Conditions:

1	Standard Five year limit
2	Development to be carried out in accordance with the approved plans.
3	No development shall take place until the applicant or their agents or successors in title has secured the implementation of a programme of archaeological work in accordance with a written scheme of investigation which has been submitted by the applicant and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
4	No development shall commence until samples of external materials have been supplied and agreed with the Local Planning Authority and retained in perpetuity thereafter.
5	Prior to occupation of the new unit the external timber louvers detailed on drawing reference AL.0.31 'Proposed Elevations' shall be fully in place and retained in perpetuity thereafter.
6	No surface water and/or land drainage shall be allowed to connect directly or indirectly with the public sewerage network.

