

# Public Document Pack

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance  
on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** County Councillor Phil Murphy (Chairman)  
County Councillor Dale Rooke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: Jill Bond, Fay Bromfield, Emma Bryn,  
Ben Callard, Tony Easson, Steven Garratt, Meirion Howells,  
Su McConnel, Jayne McKenna, Phil Murphy, Maureen Powell,  
Sue Riley, Dale Rooke and Ann Webb

County Councillors: Louise Brown, Richard John and  
Angela Sandles attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair.

### **OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Amy Longford	Development Management Area Team Manager
Joanne Chase	Solicitor
Wendy Barnard	Democratic Services Officer

### **APOLOGIES:**

County Councillors: Jan Butler and John Crook

#### **1. Declarations of Interest**

County Councillor Jayne McKenna declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2022/00494 as she was a member of Shirenewton Community Council prior to April 2022. During this time, she voted on application DM/2022/00494. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

County Councillor Jayne McKenna declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2022/00851 as she was a member of Shirenewton Community Council prior to April 2022. She was involved with the funding of application DM/2022/00851 but not the planning application. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

County Councillor Meirion Howells declared a personal, non-prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2021/00691 as he knew the applicant. County Councillor Howells abstained from voting in respect of this application.

County Councillor Tony Easson declared a personal, non-prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of application DM/2022/00492 as he is a member of the Police and Crime Panel.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance  
on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

### **2. Confirmation of Minutes**

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 2<sup>nd</sup> August 2022 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

### **3. Application DM/2021/01823 - Change of use from agricultural to One Planet development. Land south of Trecastle Farm, Trecastle Road, Llangovan, Monmouthshire.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

The local Member for Mitchel Troy and Trellech United attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Concerns have been raised regarding the impact on the landscape of the proposed buildings which will be particularly visible during the autumn and winter months.
- It is an essential One Planet Development (OPD) requirement that there is a 'light touch' on the environment with a positive landscape impact.
- OPD guidance states that dwellings and structures should not stand out in views from public vantage points and the OPD should enhance the landscape in which it sits.
- The report of the application stated that the Landscape Officer considers the development proposal acceptable subject to additional clarification around the specifics of the proposal and longer-term maintenance.
- The local Member referred to the conditions outlined in the report in that they are related to the landscape and appear to require substantial additional information. Concern was expressed that these were not being addressed at the application stage.
- It was suggested that the applicant should consider submitting the information required to allow the Planning Committee to make an informed decision in respect of the application.
- The Cruck Barn will be the most visible building due to its elevation on the site and will not have a grass roof but one made of metal or slate. The plan and elevation states that the exact material and colour are to be conditioned to allow the use of a reclaimed product. However, there appears to be no such condition in the report of the application.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- The applicant intends to construct a dwelling workshop and barn with reclaimed materials and that the exact appearance of the structures may vary from that presented in the application drawings. Concern was expressed that the importance of preserving the environment was key and that this would not be acceptable. Greater clarity was required in respect of this matter.
- Concern was expressed regarding the degree of the impact on the landscape in terms of the long access track which will cross a water course. This was considered not to be a 'light touch' on the environment.
- OPD guidance states that all water needs are met from water available on site. There are two streams on the site, but both have dried up this summer.
- The local Member asked for details regarding rainfall harvesting calculations.
- The local Member asked whether independent monitoring will be undertaken.
- The residents' impression is that the application has been given a 'light touch' in terms of ensuring its compliance with the requirement of the Policy. This is building in the open countryside with concerns regarding the landscape impact.
- Applications of this nature need to be vigorously stress tested by independent experts. Concern was expressed regarding the lack of transparency.
- Residents were concerned that approval of the application would result in disparate buildings being scattered across the open countryside.

The applicant, Paul Trotter, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following information:

- The OPD is an opportunity for the applicant to dramatically increase his sustainability while promoting biodiversity.
- Over the last five years the applicant has devoted time to research into low impact living, permaculture, regenerative agriculture, and natural building. This has come together to form the planning application presented to Planning Committee today.
- Thousands of broad leaf trees will be planted locking carbon into the soil, while increasing shelter and forage for wildlife, as well as for livestock.
- Systems have been incorporated to capture and use nutrients on site, protecting watercourses from animal manure.
- The applicant is looking forward to living with a 'light touch' on the planet, being self sufficient in water, heating and electricity, as well as growing and rearing the majority of their food.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- The applicant's transport impacts will be around half the norm and their ecological footprints will be 70% lower than the Welsh average.
- The development will be a local exemplar of sustainable living and inspire other families to address the climate change and biodiversity crises.
- The applicant intends to live on the site for the rest of their lives, raising a family and being a part of the community. Local connections have already been established locally by supporting events and volunteering in community projects.
- Produce would be sold locally providing residents with more sustainable choices.
- The applicant wants the project to benefit the local community directly. The management plan details the applicant's commitment.
- Many letters of support have been received regarding the application with a small number of objections having been received.
- There has been ample time for Officers and professional consultees to examine the application in depth.
- The concerns raised by objectors have not been supported by the assessments of the professionals.
- Monmouthshire County Council's Highways, Biodiversity and Ecology, landscapes, drainage and Natural Resources Wales (NRW) have all indicated that the proposal is acceptable and in line with Planning Policy.
- The independent OPD assessors are satisfied that the application successfully meets the criteria of the One Planet Development Policy.
- The applicant asked the Planning Committee to consider approval of the application.

The Development Management Area Manager responded as follows:

- Details of soft landscaping will be agreed as a pre-commencement condition.
- The site is already well screened by established mature vegetation.
- The use of planning conditions to agree further soft landscaping is appropriate and in accordance with the planning conditions circular.
- If the application was approved, samples of finishes could be agreed prior to construction.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- The applicant would be tied to a legal agreement and the monitoring report would be subject to annual review via the Planning Department's Monitoring Enforcement Officer.
- Officers are satisfied that there are sufficient stringent steps in place for the development to be monitored and the conditions are fully enforceable.

The local Member for Mitchel Troy and Trellech United, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- Concern was expressed that the applicant was able to submit his own visual impact statement which was considered to not be accurate. The site can be seen from roads, footpaths, the historic Motte and Bailey and listed buildings.
- The independent assessor had not undertaken the individual impact statement.
- Many of the trees surrounding the site have Ash Dieback and will need to be removed.
- The half kilometre track to the dwelling is for agricultural purposes. Clarification was sought as to whether a residential driveway will need to be applied for.
- Visibility when exiting the site is poor when looking right. The Highways Department has expressed concern and the applicant had tried to mitigate this matter by drawing up an agreement with the farmer who owns the hedge either side of the track. This notice can be ceased within seven days-notice by the farmer and will become void if either party sells their property. The highways risk to road users remains.
- Llangovan is located within a phosphate zone. Concern was expressed that a new family dwelling with livestock will produce phosphates adding to an existing problem.
- Both water courses run into the River Usk. It was considered that the business plan and predictions were questionable. With the considerable rise in living costs and high inflation, it was considered that the applicant's living figures were no longer valid which could affect the business plan and the sustainability of the development.
- The applicant predicts that the three-bed detached dwelling will be within Council Tax band A, valuing the property at £44,000 or less providing a Council Tax bill of £1071 per annum. This valuation is considerably lower than other three bed detached properties in Monmouthshire. Concern was expressed regarding the accuracy of these figures.
- The letters of support for the application do not come from local residents.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- The local Member considers that the application will neither enhance nor benefit the community and could be harmful to local businesses that sell similar products which does not adhere to OPD policy.
- Clarity was sought as to why Section 106 monies were not being undertaken.
- The local Member considers that the application does not fully meet OPD policy or that the business model is robust and sustainable.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The proposal is an inspirational development and will enhance its natural environment by increasing biodiversity in the area.
- It was suggested that consideration of the application be deferred on a public health basis. It was considered that the business plan fails to incorporate how meat will be stored in chest freezers throughout the winter months when solar panels cannot generate enough electricity to keep freezers permanently running. Concern was also expressed that some produce will be delivered via E Bikes. It was considered that the Environmental Health Department needed to scrutinise the practicality and public safety of the business plan. The development also competes with local businesses which sell similar produce. OPD policy states that the proposed business should not create a negative impact on other local businesses.

The Development Management Area Manager responded as follows:

- Advice has been taken via the independent assessor regarding the business case.
- The findings of the Council's Landscape and Urban Design Officer is that the development would be acceptable.
- Natural Resources Wales (NRW) has confirmed that it does not have any objection in respect of the nature of the development in terms of phosphates which has been screened out under the Habitats Regulations Assessment.
- Contributions towards affordable housing are set out in the Authority's Affordable Housing Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) but would not be required for a OPD proposal. Therefore, Section 106 monies are not being sought.
- The independent assessor is aware that there is a need to provide refrigeration on site and is satisfied that this can be provided but not to the detriment of the wider energy needs. The storage of meat would be subject to Environmental Health Standards and is not a Planning matter for consideration.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

- Planning permission had been granted in 2020 for the track to be surfaced with granular material for agricultural purposes. The track is sufficient and would not require any additional surfacing. The track could therefore be used in conjunction with the OPD site.
- the Independent Assessor has accepted the calculations presented by the applicant in respect of the value of the property and has advised officers accordingly.
- Consultant advice indicates that the proposed development will not be prejudicial or harmful to other local businesses.

It was proposed by County Councillor Ben Callard and seconded by County Councillor Jill Bond that application DM/2021/01823 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	9
Against approval	-	1
For deferral	-	2
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2021/01823 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

#### **4. Application DM/2021/01763 - Change of Use of the Land to an Animal Sanctuary. Temporary accommodation in the form of a touring caravan, to allow staff working at the Animal Sanctuary to stay occasionally overnight to assist with ill or injured animals. Rhewl Farm, Shirenewton To Rhewl Farm, Shirenewton, Chepstow.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

The applicant attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The animal sanctuary offers a home for life for unwanted, neglected, abused and abandoned animals.
- Currently, the site is home to 200 farmed animals. The farm is a registered charity.
- The site comprises 62 acres with woods and low pasture.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- Orchards have been planted within the sanctuary, as well as planting a medicinal herb garden for the animals. The applicant is rewilding a number of areas throughout the sanctuary.
- Work has been undertaken with wildlife charities since 2019. Orphaned bats are rehabilitated back into the wild at the sanctuary.
- 50 dormice boxes have also been put into the woods.
- Fertilizers or chemicals are never used on the land and animals are fed organic and non-genetically modified food.
- Matt Pritchard, celebrity chef, is the sanctuary's patron.
- The sanctuary had been voted one of the UK's favourite animal sanctuaries in 2020 and 2021.
- The sanctuary's team of staff are locally based and there are up to 230 volunteers that help with small events.
- The sanctuary is supported by donations and fundraisers.
- Local people are getting to know the sanctuary and are wanting to visit and volunteer. All focus is on the wellbeing of the animals which means that people cannot turn up and visit the site. However, bespoke visits have been arranged.
- It is not a commercial venture but a small sanctuary wanting to help animals in need, to protect the environment and offer support and wellbeing for people who need it.
- The caravan is required to allow staff to remain overnight and help sick animals in emergency situations.

The local Member for Shirenewton attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The sanctuary is located inappropriately off a narrow rural road. The local member made reference to the Highways Department's view in the report of the application outlining that the area has very poor sustainable transport provision with visitors attending the sanctuary having to travel by car. The open days generate additional traffic with the concentrated vehicle movements associated with the high number of open days in the sanctuary which are considered to be detrimental to the safety and capacity of the narrow, rural highway network. The Highway Authority recommends that the number of open days run by the sanctuary is controlled by way of a suitably worded condition.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- This application was part of a previous joint application which dealt with the aspect of any opening to the public but this application had been withdrawn. However, the condition allows for open days. It was considered that the application does not fully deal with all concerns. The Highways Department had submitted a strong objection to the previous application that had been withdrawn due to the nature of the road.
- Local residents are concerned regarding the highway situation. Coaches have blocked the road for a period of time whilst entering and exiting the sanctuary.
- Staff, volunteers and seasonal workers also access the site.
- The Highways Department considered that the number of open days should not be increased.
- The local Member asked the Planning Committee to defer consideration of the application as it does not deal with all the aspects of the centre. However, if the application were to be approved, the local Member asked that the Planning Committee does not alter the condition to see 16 open days for the public. 16 sessional days would be more appropriate in line with the recommendation of the Highways Department.

The Development Management Area Manager responded as follows:

- The previous application has been withdrawn.
- This application is for the touring caravan and for the operation of the site as an animal sanctuary.
- The Highways Department has considered the application and did not raise any objections to the proposals in terms of traffic movements. Highways did indicate that a restriction on the number of open days should be considered and is outlined in the conditions to the report. The limitation is to 16 open days per calendar year.
- Cars can access the site and there is ample parking provision. The level of activity should not create a significant amount of congestion or obstruction on the lane, which has been confirmed by the Highways Department.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The caravan was required in order to provide overnight care to sick animals.
- If the open days become significant or offer a tourist attraction, then this would be considered a change of use and would be subject to a separate planning application.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

- Before the sanctuary takes on any additional animals an assessment is undertaken regarding the impact that this will have on the existing animals within the sanctuary.
- The applicant was asked to consider communication with local residents when an open day is scheduled.
- For the open days, chemical toilets will be brought onto the site and taken away.

The local Member summed up as follows:

- The Planning Committee was asked to reconsider the 16 open days open to the public. Currently, the list of visitor days included VIP visits and corporate days. Over the previous 18 months there were 24 visits. It was considered that the 16 days would be adequate to cover all the types of visits.
- The local Member suggested that the Planning Committee considers 16 visitor sessions on 16 days.

In response the Development Management Area Manager informed the Committee that scale and function of the sanctuary will limit the number of people going into and leaving the site. The number of visitors will be linked to the scale of the business. The number of open days would be for the Planning Committee to determine.

Following discussion, it was proposed that the wording of the condition to control event numbers be agreed via the Delegation Panel.

It was proposed by County Councillor Jill Bond and seconded by County Councillor Ben Callard that application DM/2021/01763 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and that the condition to control event numbers be agreed via the Delegation Panel.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2021/01763 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and that the condition to control event numbers be agreed via the Delegation Panel.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance  
on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

### **5. Application DM/2022/00696 - Proposed single storey front extension. Arosfa, Llanfair Discoed, Monmouthshire, NP16 6LY.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

The local Member for Caerwent, also a Planning Committee Member, informed the Committee that locally, there is concern regarding the length of the extension.

Councillor M. John, representing Caerwent Community Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The Community Council objects to the application under Policy H6 – the extension of rural dwellings.
- In order to protect the character of the countryside, extensions to dwellings outside village boundaries should be modest and respect or enhance the appearance of the existing dwelling. They will be required to be subordinate to the existing building. Where the building is of a traditional nature to respect its existing form including the pattern and shape of openings and materials.
- The Community Council does not consider that this application fulfils the requirements of Policy H6.
- Any extension that will result in an increase of more than 50% in the volume of a rural dwelling will not normally be considered to comply with Policy H6.
- The Community Council considers that this property has merit and should be considered as traditional rural dwellings particular to the local environment. They are a characteristic and unusual feature of the locality. The dwellings are similar to foresters' cottages which are located nearby.
- Under permitted development rights, this extension would not be allowed as it currently stands.
- The Community Council knows that permitted development rules do not preclude a planning application but consider that they provide a point of reference when considering applications.
- None of the land settlement houses in the near and extended neighbourhood have extensions on their front elevations. Some have been extended sideways. Some of these houses have porches which are subordinate and are mainly in keeping with the original buildings.
- It is difficult to understand how this extension can be described as subordinate. The view of the proposed extension driving out of the village from the A48 differs to the photographs shown from another viewpoint.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

- The Community Council has concerns regarding the volume of the proposed development and the increase in the volume of the cottage from its original state. An increase of 61% since 2013.
- The Community Council has recommended that the application be refused.

Mr. S. Roderick, objecting to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Design and impact on the local character, paragraphs b, c, e and g of Policy DES1 apply.
- The extension is very large at the front of the property running adjacent to his boundary. It is not a porch. It extends 4 metres from the front elevation, is over half the height of the main dwelling and is nearly 4 metres wide.
- It will be nearly 16 times larger than a wooden porch and it can be seen from the village. It is substantially bigger than extensions of nearby neighbours and similar land settlement dwellings.
- Not one extension exceeds more than a metre from the front elevation and all are no more than 3sq.m in footprint. These extensions respect local distinctiveness, compliment their surroundings and respect their history. This application does not.
- The proposed extension is unacceptably oversized and does not enhance any architectural aspect and fails to follow the aesthetic lines of the original dwelling.
- It doesn't adhere to the local vernacular, it harms the objector's immediate landscape and the larger surrounding area.
- Policy EP1 states extensions to existing buildings should have regard to privacy, amenity and health of occupiers of neighbouring properties.
- Policy DES1 paragraph d, the equalities legislation and TAN 12 apply.
- The objector's property lies within green belt open countryside. Land Map rates the visual and sensory landscape as high and exceptional and emphasises the importance of the open undulating Caerwent landscape.
- This amenity provides a sense of openness and freedom allowing for a positive state of mental health and wellbeing. The objector has benefitted from this for the previous 13 years.
- The extension will have a detrimental impact and affect the sense of wellbeing.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- On leaving his property the objector will be presented with a 4 metre high wall reducing amenity at the front of the property by almost 50%. In the autumn and winter months this loss will be exacerbated. The loss of amenity will be amplified for the objector's wife as she relies on the use of a wheelchair. The wall will be oppressive for her lowering the quality of life that she currently enjoys.
- In making the decision to recommend approval of the application the Planning Department was required to undertake an impact assessment of the effect on people's protected characteristics. It was considered that this had been ignored.
- Policy H6 and strategic vision – all parties agree that the proposal added to the extension of 2013 would exceed the volume limit between 61% to 71%. The 50% limit would be exceeded.
- Policy H6 requires an extension to be modest. The guidance provides a clear definition for this concept. A new extension was deemed to be modest if it does not exceed 30% volume of the original dwelling. However, this could be adjusted up to 37% but it must not exceed 50%. If an extension is built after 2006 it is unlikely that another extension can be permitted unless the new works added to those carried out earlier fall within the size limit, no more than 50%.
- Approval of the application would undermine the Local Development Plan (LDP) strategy.
- The objector asked that the Planning Committee considers refusal of the application.

Richard Shuck, the applicants' representative, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The applicants have lived in the area for a number of years and appreciate the landscape that they live in.
- The garden is agricultural / rural in nature with overgrown grass and various plant life.
- Discussions had been held with the neighbour regarding the location of the extension and it had been recommended by the applicants' representative that the extension be put at the front of the property with a view to addressing the issues raised by the neighbouring party.
- The proposed extension is 1 metre from the boundary to limit, as much as possible, the loss of light in that area.
- The applicants wanted the extension to be the same size as was originally proposed on the rear of the property under permitted development rights.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- The proposed extension is in keeping with the existing property with a slate look, composite tile on the roof with a rendered finish.
- The plot size is large enough to take another small extension to the front of the property and acknowledges that it does exceed the limits of the 50% volume. However, in this case it was considered to be acceptable.
- The properties in this area have a small footprint. Therefore, it is necessary for families to increase the size of the footprint for these properties.
- The applicants require more living space via the proposed extension to accommodate an additional member of their family.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- A single storey extension to the rear of the property should not cover more than half the area around the original house. The eaves height of the extension cannot be higher than the eaves height of that of the house from which the extension projects. If the extension is located within 2 metres of any boundary of a house the eaves height cannot exceed 3 metres and the extension cannot be more than 4 metres long projecting from the rear of the property measured from the rear wall of the original house. The extension cannot be more than 4 metres in total in height.
- If the applicants extended their property to the rear and remained within these limitations then planning permission would not be required as the development could be constructed under permitted development rights.
- The proposed extension has been designed in a manner with its roof that reduces its impact on shading.
- Concern was expressed regarding the visual aspect of the proposed extension as it would change the vernacular of the neighbouring property.

It was proposed by County Councillor Dale Rooke and seconded by County Councillor Tony Easson that we be minded to refuse application DM/2022/00696 on the following grounds and that the application be re-presented to a future meeting of Planning Committee with appropriate reasons for refusal:

- Adverse impact on the amenity of the neighbouring property.
- Location, scale and design would be incongruous and out of character.
- Non-compliance with Policy H6 (volume and harmful to the character of the dwelling).

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	10
Against refusal	-	2
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that we be minded to refuse application DM/2022/00696 on the following grounds and that the application be re-presented to a future meeting of Planning Committee with appropriate reasons for refusal:

- Adverse impact on the amenity of the neighbouring property.
- Location, scale and design would be incongruous and out of character.
- Non-compliance with Policy H6 (volume and harmful to the character of the dwelling).

**6. Application DM/2021/00691 - Change of use of agricultural barn to B1 (light industrial/office) including replacement cladding. It is intended for the building to be used as premises for producing a small range of organic, fermented apple cider vinegar drinks and tonics, and fermented condiments aiming to improve natural gut health. Parc Farm, Parc Road, Llangybi, Usk, Monmouthshire.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

The local Member for Llangybi Fawr, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- She had noted the objections received regarding traffic on Parc Road and had raised these objections with the Highways Department.
- Signage on Parc Road is to be upgraded and installed within the coming weeks.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- Traffic movements would be kept to a minimum. Vehicle size and volume is likely to be decreased.
- The cladding and design will enhance the surrounding area.
- Visibility is clear when entering and exiting the site.
- The business is producing a profit and is sustainable.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

- The application will help the local economy grow.
- The application has a condition regarding the removal of permitted development in respect of lighting.

It was proposed by County Councillor Maureen Powell and seconded by County Councillor Jayne McKenna that application DM/2021/00691 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2021/00691 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

#### **7. Application DM/2021/02037 - Proposed change of use of agricultural land to provide access track to Roseham Cottage, Lane End Cottage and Wyeswood. Roseham Cottage, Bigsnap Wood Lane, Pen Y Fan, The Narth, Monmouth.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

The local Member for Mitchel Troy and Trellech United, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- The area resides within the Wye Valley AONB. However, it cannot be seen from vantage points due to the topography of the land. Much of the track is screened by trees and hedgerows with a large proportion located through an area of woodland on private land.
- Only one property could be affected by the proposal. However, the track runs to the side aspect of the dwelling and should not be greatly visually impacted upon.
- The existing driveway to the three properties is narrow with overhanging large trees and a solid stone wall either side of the entrance which large vehicles would struggle to access. In particular, emergency services vehicles.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed and the following points were noted:

- In response to a question raised regarding the lack of response from the Wye Valley AONB Unit it was noted that the requirements of the Local Development

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

Plan (LDP) policy in respect of the Wye Valley AONB would not be compromised and that the visual impact could be properly considered without the input from the Wye Valley AONB Unit.

It was proposed by County Councillor Jayne Mckenna and seconded by County Councillor Ann Webb that application DM/2021/02037 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	1
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2021/02037 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

#### **8. Application DM/2022/00492 - Proposed construction of Police Station (use class B1) and associated works. Land Between Llanfoist Highways Depot And Llanfoist Farm, Merthyr Road, Llanfoist.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to agreement of the detail of the access (and any associated minor changes to the site layout) being delegated to officers to agree via consultation with the Council's Delegation Panel. Also, that an informative be added regarding an active travel route from the site and that Condition 8 to be changed to a compliance condition from a pre-commencement condition.

The local Member for Llanfoist and Govilon, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- He fully supports the application and agrees with the location.
- Concern was expressed regarding the height of the fence and that it was against the pavement making this route somewhat inhospitable.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The Gwent Police and Crime Panel has approved the application.
- The fencing is 2.1 metres. It was noted that details regarding the fence could be agreed via the Delegation Panel which could include the local Member.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

- The proposal will enhance the area.

It was proposed by County Councillor Jayne Mckenna and seconded by County Councillor Maureen Powell that application DM/2022/00492 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to agreement of the detail of the access (and any associated minor changes to the site layout) being delegated to officers to agree via consultation with the Council's Delegation Panel. Also, that an informative be added regarding an active travel route from the site and that Condition 8 to be changed to a compliance condition from a pre-commencement condition.

Details regarding the fence would also be agreed via the Delegation Panel which would include the local Member.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	14
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2022/00492 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to agreement of the detail of the access (and any associated minor changes to the site layout) being delegated to officers to agree via consultation with the Council's Delegation Panel. Also, that an informative be added regarding an active travel route from the site and that Condition 8 to be changed to a compliance condition from a pre-commencement condition.

Details regarding the fence would also be agreed via the Delegation Panel which would include the local Member.

#### **9. Application DM/2022/00494 - New dwelling (Plot 2). Azalea Cottage, Old School Hill, Mynyddbach, NP16 6RP.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

The local Member for Shirenewton attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Concern was expressed that there was outline planning permission for two plots with a shared drive. However, there will now be the development of both shared drives under condition 8.
- Condition 11 has a construction method statement. The local Member suggested that that the following be added:

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

- Operation to avoid blocking of the road by construction vehicles during primary school starting and leaving times.
- Concern has been raised regarding overlooking issues. Condition 14 refers to the biodiversity enhancement statement which should be followed in 4. This refers to an area of woodland trees to be retained and improved at the northern end of the site. Properties in the area can now be overlooked. The local member asked that the woodland area be improved as it is contained within the current conditions. Holly trees had been removed recently exacerbating the overlooking in this area.

The Development Management Area Manager responded as follows:

- There is a condition proposed for a Construction Method Statement but this relates to ecology rather than transport vehicles entering and leaving the site. However, a Construction Traffic Management Plan could be added via condition should the Committee consider this necessary.
- In terms of overlooking, there is a 30 metre rear garden from the rear of the new property to the boundary. There is a further 30 metres from the boundary to the property behind equating to a 60 metre distance between the two dwellings. There are also a number of substantial trees with Tree Preservation Orders (TPOs) at the bottom of the garden that are to be retained along with other trees that are within that planting area. There is a significant slope on site. Therefore, it is not considered that there is a detrimental impact in terms of overlooking on the neighbours. Due to the height and vegetation in between the amenity of the neighbours is protected.
- Some felling of holly trees had been undertaken on site in order to relocate the electricity pole. There are other trees that are to be retained via condition. There are also other ecological conditions.
- Condition 14 illustrates the design and location of ecological enhancement measures which will come into force when development commences.

It was proposed by County Councillor Ben Callard and seconded by County Councillor Fay Bromfield that application DM/2022/00494 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement with an additional condition for a Construction Traffic Management Plan.

For approval - 13

Against approval - 0

Abstentions - 0

The proposition was carried.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

We resolved that application DM/2022/00494 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement with an additional condition for a Construction Traffic Management Plan.

10. **Application DM/2022/00514 - Demolition of existing buildings and erection of 2no. new buildings incorporating retail space, storage and ancillary offices associated with existing retail business. Improvements to existing carpark. Usk Garden Centre, Llanbadoc, Usk.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- Advice would be sought with the applicant to consider installing electricity vehicle charging points and cycle racks within the car park.
- The applicant would be asked to reuse material where possible.

It was proposed by County Councillor Sue Riley and seconded by County Councillor Emma Bryn that application DM/2022/00514 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	14
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2022/00514 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

11. **Application DM/2022/00851 - Hard path around recreation field. Recreation Ground, Earlswood Road, Shirenewton.**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

The local Member for Shirenewton attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Shirenewton Community Council undertook a survey of local residents, which is undertaken every five years. The previous survey suggested having a boardwalk

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm

and the Community Council included this as part of its five-year plan. This application was made due to the time limits for grant matters.

- There were a number of local objections to the application.
- The Community Council and the Recreation Association agreed that the Recreation Association could survey the community about it.
- Shirenewton Community Council had agreed that it would not proceed until the agreement of the Recreation Association had been obtained.
- The next survey of residents by Shirenewton Community Council is due in 2024.
- In view of these circumstances it would be for the Planning Committee to consider whether to defer or approve the application.

The Development Management Area Manager informed the Committee that Shirenewton Community Council is the applicant and the Planning Department had not received a request for the application to be withdrawn.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor Dale Rooke and seconded by County Councillor Emma Bryn that application DM/2022/00851 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 13

Against approval - 0

Abstentions - 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2022/00851 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

#### **12. Application DM/2022/00923 - Two proposed dormers to the front/south-east facing elevation. Rear dormer and roof terrace to rear/north-west facing elevation. Crooklands, Church Road, Undy, Caldicot, NP26 3EN.**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA and remote attendance on Tuesday, 6th September, 2022 at 2.00 pm**

- No overlooking would occur into the rear garden. There are privacy screens to the side of the terrace to protect the amenity at the back of the properties either side of Crooklands.

It was proposed by County Councillor Ben Callard and seconded by County Councillor Jayne McKenna that application DM/2022/00923 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 14

Against approval - 0

Abstentions - 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2022/00923 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

**The meeting ended at 6.25 pm.**