

Application Number: DM/2020/00537

Proposal: Two storey domestic extension

Address: Rear Barn, Manor Farm, St Bride's Road, St Brides Netherwent, Caldicot

Applicant: Mr Jon Moore

Plans: 1495:SK:01 - , 1495:SK:02 - , 1495:SK:10:02 - , 1495:SK:10:04 - , Location Plan - , Supporting Statement - ,

RECOMMENDATION: REFUSE

Case Officer: Mr David Wong

Date Valid: 20.04.2020

This application is presented to Planning Committee as the Local Member, Councillor Phil Murphy, would like Members to consider the policy position in relation to the extension to this converted barn

1.0 APPLICATION DETAILS

1.1 Site Description

Rear Barn is located along St Bride's Road, St Brides Netherwent, in the open countryside. The application site comprises a former agricultural building which has been converted into residential use.

1.2 Proposal Description

1.2.1 The application seeks permission to further extend the existing barn. The proposal is a two story extension and it would provide a new open plan kitchen, dining room and family room at the ground floor and a master bedroom with en-suite bathroom facilities at the first floor.

1.2.2 The proposed extension will be located on the north elevation of the barn. The scheme has been amended and reduced following communication with the agent but it is still considered to be unacceptable because the proposal is contrary to Policy DES1 and H4 of the Monmouthshire Local Development Plan (LDP).

1.2.3 The proposed extension has a footprint of 5m (width) by 14.5m (length) and has a ridge height of approximately 6m. The proposed extension will have a mix of external finishing materials involving a pantile roof, stonework, render, brick quoins and black painted gutters and bargeboards.

1.2.4 It is noted that the appearance of window and door frames on the east and north elevations of the proposed extension do not match with those on the west facing elevation. Although the proposed material is not specified, based on the submitted drawing, the ones on the west facing elevation would be of timber construction and the remaining ones feature a metal frame.

2.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY (if any)

Reference Number	Description	Decision	Decision Date
-------------------------	--------------------	-----------------	----------------------

DC/2007/00851	Alterations to approved scheme (Planning Reference DC/2006/00156)	Approved	14.09.2007
DC/2006/00156	Conversion of barn – alteration to approved scheme and extensions (previous permission M/4041)	Approved	15.11.2006
M/4041	Conversion of barn into dwelling.	Approved	15.11.1999

3.0 LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES

Strategic Policies

S1 LDP The Spatial Distribution of New Housing Provision
S13 LDP Landscape, Green Infrastructure and the Natural Environment
S17 LDP Place Making and Design

Development Management Policies

DES1 LDP General Design Considerations
EP1 LDP Amenity and Environmental Protection
H4 LDP Conversion/Rehabilitation of Buildings in the Open Countryside for Residential Use

3.1 SUPPLEMENTARY PLANNING GUIDANCE

Conversion of Agricultural Buildings Design Guide SPG April 2015:
<http://www.monmouthshire.gov.uk/app/uploads/2015/07/H4-LDP-Barn-Conversion-SPG-April-2015.pdf>

LDP Policy H4 (g) Conversion/Rehabilitation of Buildings in the Open Countryside to Residential Use Assessment of Re-use for Business Purposes SPG April 2015:
<http://www.monmouthshire.gov.uk/app/uploads/2015/07/LDP-Policy-H4-g-SPG-April-2015.pdf>

4.0 NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY

Planning Policy Wales (PPW) Edition 10

The primary objective of PPW is to ensure that the planning system contributes towards the delivery of sustainable development and improves the social, economic, environmental and cultural well-being as required by the Planning (Wales) Act 2015, the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 and other key legislation. A well-functioning planning system is fundamental for sustainable development and achieving sustainable places.

The planning system should create sustainable places which are attractive, sociable, accessible, active, secure, welcoming, healthy and friendly. Development proposals should create the conditions to bring people together, making them want to live, work and play in areas with a sense of place and well being, creating prosperity for all.

5.0 REPRESENTATIONS

5.1 Consultation Replies

Caerwent Community Council: No objection.

Natural Resources Wales: No objection. However, please note that due to the proximity of the site to watercourses, all works at the site must be carried out in accordance with GPP5 and PPG6:

'Works in, near or over watercourses' and 'Working at construction and demolition sites' which are available on a web site link supplied in the response.

5.2 Neighbour Notification

Five support letters received. In summary, the neighbours have no objection and they consider the proposed design is in keeping with the area and will enhance the appearance of the building. The development does not impinge or affect any neighbouring properties, whilst giving the space needed for a modern family.

5.3 Local Member Representations

Councillor Murphy would like Members to consider the policy position in relation to extension to this converted barn.

6.0 EVALUATION

6.1 Principle of Development

6.1.1 The barn is in the open countryside and therefore there is a presumption against development unless there is specific support within national or local policy. In this case, the dwelling in question is a converted barn in the open countryside. In terms of LDP policies, Policy H4 of the Local Development Plan (LDP) relates to the conversion / rehabilitation of a building in the open countryside for residential use and it states that the same criteria will be applied to proposals to extend buildings that have already been converted. Therefore, Policy H4 of the LDP is applicable to this application.

6.1.2 LDP Policy H4 under criterion a) states that: 'the form, bulk and general design of the proposal, including any extensions, respect the rural character and design of the building' and criterion f) provides that 'the building is capable of providing adequate living space (and ancillary space such as garaging) within the structure. Only very modest extensions will be allowed and normal permitted development rights to extend further or to construct ancillary buildings will be withdrawn'.

6.1.3 As highlighted above, Policy H4 allows only 'very modest extensions' to barn conversions located in the countryside. Therefore, in principle, extensions are allowed if they are very modest. The meaning of modest is further explained within the relevant Supplementary Planning Guidance (Rural Conversions to a Residential or Tourism Use (Policies H4 and T2)). Paragraph 3.18 of this SPG states that... "The starting point for rural conversions should be the conversion of the existing structure without the need for extensions. However, any such extensions would need to be carefully assessed to ensure that any additions respect and harmonise with the existing building in relation to its size, scale and form. Extensions must be unobtrusive and subservient to the existing building in every respect. Extensions that would introduce incongruous elements will not be permitted".

6.1.4 In this case, the property has had the benefit of two applications granted in 2006 and 2007 which enabled the following enlargements:

- a) Two single storey extensions (subject to application: DC/2006/00156)
- b) Increase of the overall height of the entire barn (subject to application: DC/2007/00851).

6.1.5 The previous 2006 and 2007 planning consents highlighted above have both been implemented. Therefore, the barn has already seen an increase of around 20% in volume since the residential conversion was originally approved because of these previously approved extensions.

6.1.6 Taking into account that the existing single storey kitchen element will be removed to enable this development, the two storey extension now proposed would still increase the size of the already extended barn by around 65%, which would be a significant increase and would clearly not be a 'very modest' extension. When considered in association with the previous extensions, the

overall increase in volume would be approximately 80% of the original barn and, therefore, contrary to the principle of Policy H4 of the LDP.

6.2 Visual/Design Considerations

6.2.1 The existing barn is traditional and simple in form and design and, despite the previously approved extensions, the previous schemes retained this character.

6.2.2 It is noted that the west elevation of the proposed extension is to be set back by some 1000mm from the main barn and with an appearance that is similar to the one on the main barn. The width of this proposed extension is only marginally narrower than the main barn (some 500mm) and it has the same ridge height as the main barn. This new two storey extension is to be built along the northern elevation of the main barn and as a result, when it is viewed from the road, it would introduce a double roof with a central valley design to this simple linear barn so is considered to be an incongruous form of development.

6.2.3 In addition, the proposed extension would measure 14.5m long (the upper floor is 12m long), this would significantly change the character of the barn by altering its form and screening the majority of the western elevation of this traditional barn. In addition, the proposed fenestration arrangement (along with the materials) and the new flat-roofed single storey projection on the east and north elevations would not be in keeping with the existing character of the barn. As a result, the proposal would erode the character of the original barn to an extent whereby the traditional, simple appearance of the barn will be lost, which is contrary to Policy H4 criterion a), that requires the form, bulk and general design of the proposal, including any extensions, to respect the rural character and design of the building.

6.2.4 In addition, the proposed fenestration and the flat roofed single storey element on the east elevation are modern and conflict with the traditional character of this barn. As a result, the proposed extension would cause unacceptable harm to the character of the original barn to an extent whereby the traditional, simple appearance of the barn will be lost.

6.2.5 The proposal is also considered to be contrary to Policy DES1, particularly criterion f) that requires the use of appropriate building decoration, pattern and styles to enhance the appearance of the proposal. It is also in conflict with Policy H4 criterion a) and Policy DES1 criterion c) which require alterations and extensions to rural buildings to respect their form and appearance. Furthermore, this proposal should also have regard to the Council's Conversion of Agricultural Building's Design Guide SPG; Section 7.0 sets out that extensions "should follow the existing traditional agricultural character of the building and be subservient to the existing building in every respect", which this development fails to do.

6.3 Residential Amenity

6.3.1 The proposed extension would not have an adverse impact on the residential amenity of neighbours. The closest dwelling to the south of the barn is the Lower Middle Barn which is less than 8m away. However, the proposed extension is on the elevation on the opposite side of the barn and, therefore, will have no impact.

6.3.2 Manor Cottage is to the north of the proposed extension and is approximately 30m away. Therefore, there is sufficient separating distance to ensure there would not be an adverse impact as a result of the development.

6.3.3 It is considered that the proposal would not have an unacceptable impact on residential amenity and would be in accordance with LDP Policy EP1.

6.4 Biodiversity Considerations

6.4.1 The barn conversion has internal vaulted ceilings, is well maintained, and well-lit externally. The building was inspected and there are no missing tiles, no cracks and the bargeboards are well maintained.

6.4.2 In addition, no significant biodiversity issues have been identified at the site. Therefore, it is, therefore, considered to have limited value for bats and no further information in relation to bats was considered necessary. The proposal is acceptable in accordance with Policy NE1.

6.5 Highway Implications

6.5.1 There is ample parking and turning provision within the site. Therefore, no issue of this kind is anticipated.

6.6 **Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015**

6.6.1 The duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales has been considered, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under section 3 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (the WBFG Act). In reaching this recommendation, the ways of working set out at section 5 of the WBFG Act have been taken into account and it is considered that this recommendation is in accordance with the sustainable development principle through its contribution towards one or more of the Welsh Ministers' well-being objectives set out in section 8 of the WBFG Act.

6.7 **Conclusion**

The proposed extension does not comply with Policies DES1, H4 and the relevant SPGs (Rural Conversions to a Residential or Tourism Use (Policies H4 and T2) & Conversion of Agricultural Buildings Design Guide) and has an unacceptable impact on the appearance of the original barn and is recommended for refusal.

7.0 **RECOMMENDATION: REFUSE**

Reasons for Refusal:

1 The cumulative impact of the proposed extension together with the previously approved extensions are not considered to be very modest and would cause unacceptable harm to the traditional character of the original barn and would result in a development which is out of keeping with the rural setting. The proposal is therefore contrary to criterion f) of Policy H4 of the Monmouthshire County Council Local Development Plan

2 The resultant bulk, form and appearance of the proposed extension would be incongruous to the traditional character of the original barn, harming the appearance of the building contrary to criterion a) of Policy H4 and criteria c) and f) of Policy DES1 of the Monmouthshire County Council Local Development Plan.