

Public Document Pack
MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
March, 2020 at 2.00 pm**

PRESENT: County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: J. Becker, L. Brown, D. Dovey, A. Easson, M. Feakins, R. Harris, G. Howard, P. Murphy, M. Powell, A. Webb, S. Woodhouse,

County Councillors: D. Jones, V. Smith and J. Watkins attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair.

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Louise Corbett	Strategy & Policy Officer - Affordable Housing
Denzil – John Turbevill	Commercial Solicitor
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

County Councillor P. Clarke left the meeting following determination of application DM/2019/01761 and did not return.

County Councillor A. Easson left the meeting following determination of application DM/2019/01839 and did not return.

County Councillor J. Becker left the meeting following determination of application DM/2019/01879 and did not return.

APOLOGIES:

County Councillors: D. Evans and J. Higginson

1. Declarations of Interest

County Councillor P. Clarke declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of applications DM/2019/02051, DC/2017/01335 and DM/2020/00023 as he is a Director of Capsel Ltd. (a subsidiary of Monmouthshire Housing Association). He left the meeting taking no part in the discussions or voting thereon.

County Councillor A. Webb declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of applications DM/2019/02051, DC/2017/01335 and DM/2020/00023 as she is a board member of Monmouthshire Housing Association. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussions or voting thereon.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
March, 2020 at 2.00 pm**

2. Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 4th February 2020 were confirmed and signed by the Chair subject to the following amendment:

Application DM/2019/01480 – the paragraph at the bottom of page 17 be amended as follows:

Members did also suggest that there were conditions put on for a Construction Management Plan and also that a condition be added to outline that the site is for residential use only.

3. Application DM/2019/00800 - Demolition of existing bungalow and outbuildings and replacement with 2no. detached two storey dwelling houses with altered driveway access from highway. Homestead, Wainfield Lane, Gwehelog, Usk

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

The local Member for Llanbadoc, County Councillor V. Smith, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- An access along Wainfield Lane had been created on this site before the Planning application had been made.
- A previous application for this site had been approved in 2007, as indicated in the report of the application, following extensive negotiations regarding the ridge height and that it should not intrude and spoil the view of the rural landscape.
- A further application to the site had been submitted in 2007 in which new proposals had been approved. However, it was assumed that the ridge height, as agreed for the previous application, would also apply for this building. However, this was not the case and the application went forward with a higher ridge height than had been previously supported.
- The ridge height impacts on the view of the landscape. There is no reference in the report of today's application to an appeal that had been refused many years ago.
- There had been an appeal against the development of residence on the land adjacent to the new plot on this site. The reasons provided for that refusal were visual impact in such an elevated location. On the other side of the road a corner site had also been refused.
- The local Member considers that there would not be any great social economic, environmental and cultural wellbeing by squeezing in an additional dwelling on a constrained rural site.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- Rural development differs from urban development.
- The Monmouthshire Landscape Officer commented on the ridge line of plot 1, the height of that dwelling, the impact that it would have and the trees to help disguise it.
- The Local Member considers that the design of the link is inappropriate for that site.
- The original plots on Wainfield Lane had been required to have half an acre of land to deal with foul water and sewage. Over the years, there has been an increase in the number of developments in this area. Residents are concerned regarding the way the treatment of sewage and foul water is being dealt with.
- The local Member does not object to the single replacement dwelling subject to an appropriate design and a ridge height that does not intrude onto the landscape.
- The local Member has concerns regarding the sub-division on the plots.
- It would be less of an inconvenience to neighbours to build both plots at the same time.
- The proposed development is not suitable for the area.

Mr. T. James, representing objectors to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The net result of the proposal is an additional property on the end of the line of properties within Wainfield Lane, extending the development and setting a precedent here.
- Plot 2 is presented as the infill plot. However, the resident considered that this would be the replacement plot as the garage and the dwelling straddles the footprint of the original bungalow.
- A planning application for that as a replacement plot should not be granted. It is not close to the footprint of the original bungalow and it also extends the ribbon of development on that side of the lane.
- The objector considers that he has not had an opportunity to make comment on plot 1 as a replacement plot. He therefore asked the Planning Committee to refuse the application and force the applicant to make an application for a single dwelling and then make an application for an infill development allowing residents an opportunity to make representations on that as a replacement plot.
- Two precedents will be set if the application is approved, namely, pulling down a property and replacing with two properties and it would allow the extension of the

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

ribbons of development on Wainfield Lane. This would lead to further development of Wainfield Lane.

- The development that is happening on Wainfield Lane is already beginning to cause drainage issues in respect of foul water and stormwater running onto the roads.
- The density of the site is too great.
- The ridge height varies on existing properties making it impossible to have a consistent ridge height, going forward.

The applicant's agent, Mr. G. Buckle, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The scheme has been amended following consultation with the local Authority to ensure that it complies fully with Planning Policy H3, relating to infill dwellings in minor villages.
- By amending the proposal a larger frontage for both properties has been achieved and an amended landscape proposal should be welcomed.
- The amended proposal does not extend beyond the existing bungalow footprint.
- There have been no objections to the proposal received via the Highways Department.
- The scheme accommodates parking requirements laid down by the local Authority.
- The visual impact with the adjacent property has been minimised by the existing garage which was originally attached the client's land, Homestead.
- The garage has been purchased by the adjoining owners and can remain as a permanent screening.
- There have been numerous infill developments along Wainfield Lane, all of which comply with Local Development Plan (LDP) Policy. The majority of objections come from residents of these infill properties, all of which had similar planning concerns at the time.
- The area of the site is a third of an acre and can accommodate two dwellings which ensures that the proposal makes the best use of development land.
- The area of land for each plot is similar to other approved infill developments along Wainfield Lane.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- In the redesign of the site the properties are well set back within the site and coupled with a sustainable landscape proposal, will reduce the visual impact.
- The ridge heights adjacent to Ty Cwtch are the same and will have limited impact.
- The large gardens to the front and rear will provide areas for sustainable urban drainage.
- Highway safety will not be adversely affected as there is only a net increase of one dwelling.
- There is sufficient space to provide the turning area on site allowing vehicles to enter and exit the site in a forward direction.
- There is ample parking for at least three vehicles per plot.
- The proposed double garage adjacent to the neighbour's property will provide a screening to Ty Cwtch.
- Soft landscaping will screen any negative visual impact. In addition, it is proposed to plant a native species hedgerow to maintain the integrity of the Wainfield Lane frontage.
- The proposals will not affect the village character which extends beyond Wainfield Lane to the village of Gwehelog.
- The proposed dwellings are to be finished externally with natural materials including a natural slate roof.
- The design and appearance of both dwellings is appropriate to the surrounding area reflecting the mixed and varied styles of properties which have been constructed in recent years.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- It was considered that there were no planning grounds to refuse the application.
- The plot is large enough to accommodate the proposed dwellings. The dwellings would fall within the curtilage and would not be located outside of the village boundary.
- Concern was expressed regarding the position of the double garage in front of plot two. The roofline could be reduced as the current proposal might have a negative impact on the outlook from Ty Cwtch.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The proposed dwellings will be served by two separate treatment plants. Therefore, it would be appropriate for a foul drainage system to be conditioned if the application was approved and subject to meeting Building Regulations.
- A Member considered that the criteria that the Committee should be applying is covered in Policy DES1, overdevelopment of the site and whether the plot is as spacious as the existing properties in the area or not. In response, the Head of Planning informed the Committee that under Policy H3, the site could be considered as redevelopment of the site, allowing an efficient use within the residential curtilage and a natural boundary to the settlement. The Member considered that the correct policy was not being applied in this instance.
- The application is making efficient use of the land. The houses are being set into the plot and not on the road frontage and it is no different to other developments that happen across the County. The Application is sympathetic to the space.

The local Member summed up as follows:

- Concern was expressed regarding the height of the building and the impact that it will have on the surrounding landscape.
- Should the application be approved, the local Member asked that the design of the properties be looked at again and that the ridge height also be reviewed and the affect that this will have on the surrounding landscape.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DM/2019/00800 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement. Also, that an additional condition be added to approve the details of foul drainage including the removal of the existing arrangement.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	8
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	5

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00800 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement. Also, that an additional condition be added to approve the details of foul drainage including the removal of the existing arrangement.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
March, 2020 at 2.00 pm**

4. Application DM/2019/02051 - Construction of 20no. affordable housing units, landscaping and associated works. Land At Wern Gifford, Pandy, Abergavenny, NP7 8DL

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the nine conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement.

Councillor A. Bentley, representing Llanvihangel Crucorney Community Council, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The sewerage issue reported by the Community Council is not with the sewerage plant but with the main sewerage pipe that runs through the village.
- The current sewerage system was built in the mid 1960's to support 25 houses plus the future development of Wern Gifford (100+ dwellings).
- The system is now servicing in excess of 250 dwellings along with three public houses and three caravan camping sites across the two villages.
- Over a significant number of years and also in recent weeks, local residents in the village have experienced sewage coming up through the drains onto their properties and within dwellings coming up through the toilets.
- The hydraulic modelling assessment of the public sewage system of Pandy and Llanvihangel Crucorney, undertaken in 2013, had outlined that the 150mm diameter gravity foul sewage pipe is hydraulically overloaded.
- There have been three housing developments granted since this assessment had been undertaken and additional infill of dwellings despite this finding.
- The hydraulic modelling assessment had confirmed that the amount of storm water entering the bottom end of the catchment exceeds the design capacity of the sewers in this area in times of heavy rainfall. During recent storms, the pipe work did not cope.
- Welsh Water had informed the Community Council that it was looking to include further investigation work.
- The Community Council considers that the proposed development is in breach of the specified policies within the current Local Development Plan.

Mr. B. Griffiths, representing objectors to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair. The Committee was informed that there is support for affordable homes in the area. However, there is a need to resolve the following issues:

- Traffic issues – The developer had stated that the road access to the development assessment was based on a computer generated model which

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

indicated that the traffic volume would not present a problem. Concern was expressed that not all of the data was included when compiling this model.

- During periods of high activity such as the school run during the morning and afternoon periods, it was noted that the afternoon run causes significant traffic problems.
- The main access route is frequently blocked during this period by parked vehicles and school buses leaving large tractors and stock lorries unable to access this route.
- This matter had been presented to the Community Council which had been addressed with the school and community police. However, this issue has continued over many years.
- Local residents consider this could be avoided by moving the proposed development providing an entry and exit onto the adjacent Grosmont Road. This route also provides access to the A465 trunk road.
- Last year the Local Authority invited landowners to submit candidate sites that could be considered for inclusion for development in the replacement Local Development Plan (LDP).
- The landowner owns the land adjacent to Grosmont Road and has submitted a piece of land for the next LDP, which is located adjacent to the current proposed development on land adjacent to Wern Gifford.
- This proposed candidate site is not yet approved. However, given that the building line has already been breached, residents consider that this piece of land will be approved for development, going forward. This site would be significantly larger than the proposed development.
- Objectors ask the Planning Committee to consider the impact on the current residents of Wern Gifford and future proof this development with an alternative access point via the Grosmont Road.
- Sewage issues have been occurring over a number of years with raw sewage spilling from manhole covers during periods of heavy rainfall.

The local Member for Crucorney, attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair, outlined the following points:

- It is imperative that there is an infrastructure to support the proposed development. With 20 dwellings proposed, concerns have been raised as to whether the local school will be able to accommodate the increase in the number of children who will be residing in the new dwellings. Will the access route which passes the school allow safe access and exit to new residents and existing residents who reside at Wern Gifford?

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- Traffic travels through Wern Giffiord to access the farm where people work.
- Concern was expressed as to whether the main carrier pipe will cope with the waste produced. The system is of a good standard except for the pipe that carries the sewage from Llanvihangel Crucorney to Pandy, a distance of approximately one mile.
- The pipe is 150mm in diameter and was built in the mid 1960s when there was about 25 – 30 dwellings, as well as the school in Pandy. It currently serves about 250 dwellings.
- There has been no further development or improvement of the pipe work but there has been a significant increase in what needs to be carried in it.
- In 2013, Welsh Water had admitted that the findings of its hydraulic modelling assessment had indicated that the 150mm gravity foul sewer, serving Pandy, was hydraulically overloaded. Therefore, the system is considered not to be fit for purpose.
- In a more recent communication, Welsh Water had placed conditions on this development in that no development shall commence until a drainage scheme for the site has been submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.
- The scheme should not allow for the disposal of foul water into the sewerage system in order to prevent hydraulic overloading of the public sewage system, to protect the health and safety of residents and to ensure no pollution.
- It would appear the pipe can cope if the amount of water entering it is reduced.
- The problem lies with the main carrier pipe.
- Homes are already being subjected to sewage overflowing.
- Without improvement to the pipe work, the significant increase in waste to be disposed will subject current residents and those who will move into the new development to increased chances of sewage re-appearing in their properties.
- The local Member asked that the Planning Committee defers consideration of the application until Welsh Water replaces the 150mm pipe to a larger size to be fit for purpose to carry away sewage for current and future homes within the area.

The applicant's agent, Francesca Sanders, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The officer recommendation of the application is for approval.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- There are no outstanding objections from the County Council's internal consultees regarding the application.
- The site is allocated for residential development and will provide much needed affordable homes to meet the needs of the community.
- A number of concerns have been raised by local residents relating to flood risk, drainage, highways capacity and the capacity of the local primary school.
- In relation to flood risk and drainage, the flood consequences assessment confirms that the majority of the site, including all of the proposed dwellings, are located outside of the flood plain with only a small section of the access road being located within it.
- Analysis undertaken - the proposed development is assessed to be at low risk from all sources of flooding.
- A safe access and egress can be achieved for emergency services.
- During recent flooding events in South Wales the site experienced no flooding.
- In relation to drainage, Welsh Water has confirmed that there is sufficient capacity in the vicinity of the site to accommodate the proposed development.
- The issues that local residents have historically experienced in Wern Gifford were as a result of blockages within the existing system. Welsh Water is currently working to resolve this matter. These issues are unrelated to the proposal and will not be exacerbated by the proposed development.
- With regard to access and highways, the applicant is aware of local residents concerns that the proposed development will lead to additional traffic which they consider will overload the system. The transport statement confirmed that the proposed development will have minimal impact on the local highway network and there is sufficient capacity in the vicinity of the site to accommodate the proposal.
- In relation to primary school capacity, there is sufficient capacity at the local primary school to accommodate four pupils which could arise from the proposed development. There is also additional capacity at another primary school within an acceptable distance of the site.
- In terms of the design of the proposed development, the dwellings will comprise of high quality materials.
- A comprehensive Suds landscaping and green infrastructure scheme is proposed.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- New areas of meadow will also be created to the north and south of the site achieving a net gain in terms of biodiversity.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- There is a need for affordable housing in the area.
- Officers' recommendation is for approval of the application subject to Natural Resources Wales (NRW) signing off the proposal. NRW had indicated that it would support the scheme subject to further assessments being undertaken.
- The issues regarding sewage related to a different matter and had now been resolved.
- Welsh Water has no objection to the application.
- The sewage issues within the area need to be addressed before approval of the application is granted.
- Concern was expressed that the application might not adhere to Planning Policy Wales (PPW) 10.
- If consent is granted, a Section 106 legal agreement will need to be signed to ensure the affordable housing tenure. Therefore, a decision regarding this application will not be imminent.
- Concern was expressed that the site remains in C2 flood zone and is against national and local planning policies. NRW has asked for extra time to undertake sufficient modelling to judge the accuracy of C2 flood zone.
- In response to the concerns raised, the Head of Planning informed the Planning Committee that there is a balance to be made in respect of the application. All of the buildings are located outside of the C2 flood zone. There is a small section of garden which touches the flood zone. The access is covered by the flood zone. However, NRW has stated that emergency services vehicles would be able to access the site. The buildings would be free of flooding. This is in accordance with TAN 15. Subject to NRW finding the flood modelling acceptable, this could be verified via the Delegation Panel before any consent is issued.
- In relation to the affordable housing, that will be agreed via a unilateral undertaking.
- The sustainable location of the site is key as it is in close proximity to a primary school and is on a bus route.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- With regard to the infrastructure of the site, Welsh Water has outlined that the capacity of the development can be accommodated within the existing infrastructure.
- Surface water would not go into the existing infrastructure. That would be dealt with via a sustainable urban drainage system.
- With regard to the local primary school, as the proposed development is for affordable housing provision, the Local Education Authority would be required to address any additional capacity, in accordance with the priorities of Monmouthshire County Council.
- The Social Housing Grant allocated in this financial year for Wern Gifford equates to £1.5M.
- The current waiting list within Monmouthshire for affordable housing provision equates to over 2000 people.
- The site is an allocated site located within the Local Development Plan (LDP).
- Concern was expressed that Welsh Water should address the drainage issues that have been raised before the application is approved.
- The Head of Planning informed the Committee that Welsh Water has not objected to the application on capacity grounds and considers that the additional capacity can be accommodated and the existing infrastructure is fit for purpose. The drainage scheme will be conditioned as part of the development and officers will be working with Welsh Water to ensure that the infrastructure is fit for purpose.
- A Member asked if a pre-commencement condition could be put in place with a view to Welsh Water addressing the sewage issue as this would not affect the Social Housing Grant allocation scheduled to be received for Wern Gifford. In response, the Head of Planning Stated that Welsh Water had indicated that no problems were envisaged with the waste water treatment works for the treatment of domestic discharges from this site and the infrastructure was fit for purpose.
- It was noted that the Social Housing Grant is not a material consideration in determining the application.
- It was noted that none of the properties in Wern Gifford had flooded recently.

The local Member summed up as follows:

- There is no local objection to having affordable housing in the area.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- There are four places available at the local primary school. However, the development will accommodate 20 families. Therefore, some children will not be able to attend the local primary school but will have to travel elsewhere.
- With regard to the sewage issue, the problem is the diameter of the pipe being too small.
- Residents' concerns should not be overlooked.
- Recent unprecedented flooding events across South Wales are a concern to the area and that the site is located in a C2 flood zone.
- The local Member asked that the Planning Committee consider deferral of the application.

The Head of Planning informed the Committee that there is a condition outlined by Welsh Water for foul drainage (not in the report of the application) which can be added. Also, the colour of the render on the proposed development could be conditioned via external finishes.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DM/2019/02051 be approved subject to the nine conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement. Also that further conditions be added to address the approval of i) Foul drainage details and ii) external finishes to be approved. Approval is subject to Natural Resources Wales (NRW) finding the flood modelling acceptable and in accordance with TAN15. This is to be verified via the Delegation Panel before any consent is issued.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	8
Against the proposal	-	2
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/02051 be approved subject to the nine conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement. Also that further conditions be added to address the approval of i) Foul drainage details and ii) external finishes to be approved. Approval is subject to Natural Resources Wales (NRW) finding the flood modelling acceptable and in accordance with TAN15. This is to be verified via the Delegation Panel before any consent is issued.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd
March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

5. Application DC/2017/01335 - Full planning application for demolition of existing buildings and residential development with associated works. Cross Ash Garage, B4521 Hill House to Trebella Farm, Cross Ash NP7 8PL

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- Support was expressed for the application as it was for affordable housing provision. However, concern was expressed that the zinc roof would not fit in with the surrounding area.
- It was noted that properties with zinc roofs were located in other areas of the County.
- Overhanging eaves should be considered on the properties.
- The local Member, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the need for affordable housing in this location. However, concern was expressed regarding the zinc roof.
- Concern was expressed that the site might be too tight to accommodate three dwellings and considered that two larger dwellings might be more appropriate.
- In response to the matters raised, the Development Management Area Manager informed the Committee that the overhangs and roofing materials could be addressed via a planning condition. With regard to the number of affordable properties on the site, these would need to be DQR compliant in terms of their size. All properties would have external sheds for additional storage. It was noted that there was significant need for two bed affordable housing units within the area.
- A request was made for a condition to be added regarding the lintels and external roof materials to be decided by the Delegation Panel.

It was proposed by County Councillor R. Edwards and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DC/2017/01335 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement. Also that additional conditions be added for foul and surface water drainage details to be submitted and approved (as outlined in late correspondence). Plus a condition be added requiring approval of external finishes and details of eaves (overhangs).

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	11
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2017/01335 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement. Also that additional conditions be added for foul and surface water drainage details to be submitted and approved (as outlined in late correspondence). Plus a condition be added requiring approval of external finishes and details of eaves (overhangs).

6. Application DC/2018/00218 - Retention of timber close boarded fence on south boundary, and raise level of no. 21 garden between 120mm and 810mm over the fence length. 21 Jasper Tudor Crescent Abergavenny NP7 9AZ

We considered the report of the application presented for refusal for one reason, as outlined in the report.

Members had been minded to refuse application DC/2018/00218 at the Planning Committee meeting on 4th February 2020 and had agreed that it be re-presented to Planning Committee with reasons for refusal.

In noting the detail of the application the following points were identified:

- Approval of the application would set a precedent across the County.
- If the application was refused then the land would have to be returned to its original form.
- Some Members expressed support for the application as outlined at the previous Planning Committee meeting.
- The local Member outlined the history relating to this matter for those Members who were not present at the last meeting.
- The Head of Planning informed the Committee that the reason for refusal was to demonstrate the harmful effect on neighbour amenity from surface water drainage. Officers considered that the applicant had made the necessary requirements to ensure that the drainage solution put on site was acceptable.

It was proposed by County Councillor G. Howard and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DC/2018/00218 be refused for one reason, as outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	6
Against refusal	-	3
Abstentions	-	4

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2018/00218 be refused for one reason, as outlined in the report.

7. Application DM/2019/01214 - The demolition of the existing corrugated arched tin shed and replacement by a two storey residential dwelling. Land Adjacent To 13 Fosterville Crescent, Abergavenny

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

The local Member for Castle ward, Abergavenny, also a Planning Committee Member, considered that the application would not enhance the surrounding area. The site is too narrow and is located on a plot that is too small for the development.

Having considered the report of the application and the local Member's views, the following points were noted:

- The plot is too small for the proposed development.
- There is no space available to turn a vehicle around in order to leave the plot in a forward gear.
- The proposed development is incongruous with any other properties in the area.
- The proposed development is not suitable for the location.
- There are no reasons to refuse the application. It provides a unique home in a town location which is fully supported by the full infrastructure to the area.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that we be minded to refuse application DM/2019/01214 on the grounds that the proposed development is of incongruous form and design and is harmful to the character and appearance of the conservation area.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	7
Against refusal	-	4
Abstentions	-	2

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that we be minded to refuse application DM/2019/01214 on the grounds that the proposed development is of incongruous form and design and is harmful to the character and appearance of the conservation area and that the application be re-presented to Planning Committee with appropriate reasons for refusal.

8. Application DM/2019/00632 - Convert existing 4/5 bedroom detached dwelling into 2 (3 bedroom) dwellings with minor extensions. Cayo Farm, Llandenny, Usk

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 10 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

In noting the detail of the application, it was considered to be a sympathetic plan to convert a building that is in a poor condition.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DM/2019/00632 be approved subject to the 10 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00632 be approved subject to the 10 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement.

9. Application DM/2019/00655 - Conversion of former Quaker meeting house and adjoining barn into residential use. Unit 5, The Cayo, Cayo Farm, Llandenny, Usk

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the eight conditions as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- Barn conversions are exempt from having to pay a Section 106 financial contribution under the new Supplementary Planning Guidance.
- In response to a Member's question, it was noted that there is no condition regarding soft landscaping. The provision of an orchard could be provided without planning permission.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- If the application was approved then an important historical building will be sympathetically preserved.
- The building is listed which is one of the reasons that the building is exempt from having to pay a Section 106 financial contribution under the new Supplementary Planning Guidance.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DM/2019/00655 be approved subject to the eight conditions as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00655 be approved subject to the eight conditions as outlined in the report.

10. Application DM/2019/01761 - Residential development of 130 dwellings, associated infrastructure and landscaping. Land to east of Church Road, Caldicot

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Caldicot Castle ward attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The majority of residents are opposed to the development.
- There are concerns regarding the distribution of the affordable housing units throughout the site as the units are intended to be pepper potted. However, there is a large section of affordable units situated in the new section of the site.
- Taking into account the affordable housing units that are already located within the Neddern Rise development, this abuts the area of affordable units situated in the new section of the site creating a very large concentration of affordable housing in that section of the whole area.
- There have been a number of incidents of anti-social behaviour in that area. Residents are concerned that this matter would be exacerbated by providing more single bed occupancy premises there.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- Drainage and flooding issues are a concern for this area. Caldicot had recently flooded with some properties affected by flood water.
- The report of the application indicates that the drainage system is still to be designed. Water will stay in pipes underground except in extreme rainfall events. Concern was expressed that in extreme weather conditions the water will run off into properties, as recently experienced.
- Residents suffering from flooding will not be residing on the new development as this is located on a hill. The residents affected will be the ones who reside downstream and at the bottom of the hill.
- Attenuation basins need to be carefully looked at. Concern was expressed that they will not be sufficient to cope with extreme rainfall events.
- The County Council had passed a climate emergency policy acknowledging that extreme weather events will occur more often. The County Council has a responsibility not to make ill-advised decisions regarding this matter.
- With regard to the construction traffic management plan, there are concerns about traffic movements on and off the site. The current proposal is for all routes to go through one area on the site. However, there is potential for a second access point on the site.
- There are existing issues relating to planning and traffic movements in the Neddern Rise development which need to be solved or additional problems will occur.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, the following points were noted:

- The drainage issues should be addressed, going forward.
- Concern was expressed regarding the clustering of affordable housing units adjacent to other affordable units from a previous development.
- Caldicot Town Council had also raised concerns regarding the matters raised by the local Member.
- Concern was expressed regarding the construction traffic management plan and the impact that this will have in the morning commute / school run and afternoon school run. It was suggested that consultation be undertaken with the local Member regarding this matter to alleviate any potential problems that might occur.
- In response to issues raised, the Head of Planning informed the Committee that in relation to the construction traffic management plan, that is a separate planning application which is being reviewed by the Highways Department.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

Determination of this application will be made in due course. Some of the other matters raised are subject to other planning applications which are being considered by officers.

- Drainage matters are also being reviewed via a separate planning application.
- With regard to flooding matters, this application is not located within a flood zone. Natural Resources Wales (NRW) did not object to the planning application, neither did it object to the outline planning consent. Welsh Government had also reviewed that planning application via a call in consideration but did not call in the application.
- The development is in accordance with TAN 15 and does not have any potential implications regarding flooding.
- With regard to land drainage, this is part of a separate planning application. The runoff rates will be a greenfield rate which will be the same or similar to the current run off rate.
- The Neddern Brook did flood recently. However, it is a flood plain and is there to take away flood water within that area.
- With regard to the distribution of affordable housing, officers have worked with the developer with a view to providing pepper potting throughout the site. There is an existing area of affordable housing units in the location. Monmouthshire County Council's policy is that properties over 15 are not pepper potted. There is a boundary along the rear of the existing properties. This housing estate will not function together. It is considered that there is no issue with how the affordable housing units are distributed throughout the site. 35% of the properties on the site are affordable housing units (45 units) making it difficult to have a fully pepper potted scheme.
- Pepper potting of affordable housing units encourages inclusion within the community.
- It was considered that none of the drainage plans, under current standards, would pass. However, it was noted that the application had come forward before these approvals were required.
- Disappointment was expressed that there were only three bungalows located on the site as there is a national shortage of these properties which are in high demand.
- Reference was made to the height of the dwellings being a maximum of nine metres and how this related to existing properties within the surrounding area. In response, the heights of the properties have been carefully looked at in comparison to the existing dwellings and the levels on the site and they will not

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

look incongruous. The design of the properties will tie in with existing housing development.

- The Head of Planning informed the Committee that the affordable housing units have been pepper potted throughout the site in appropriate locations providing a balanced spread of properties.
- There is a clear demarcation between the existing affordable housing units and the new affordable units.

The local Member summed up as follows:

- The pepper potting of the site is an important issue.
- Residents need to feel that they have been heard in respect of this development.
- The issues regarding antisocial behaviour have been reported to the Police.
- The local Member asked to be kept informed of developments in respect of the drainage issues, going forward.

It was proposed by County Councillor G. Howard and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DM/2019/01761 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	2

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01761 be approved subject to the six conditions as outlined in the report.

11. Application DM/2019/01839 - Modification of condition number(s): 2, 6, 13, 14 and 15 relating to application DC/2014/01226. Land rear of High Trees, Steep Street, Chepstow

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the 14 conditions as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- In response to a Member's question, the Development Services Manager informed the Committee that with regard to the impact of the application, it will be similar to the existing building. The top part of the building will be viewed with the

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

lower levels being screened by the existing wall. The building will not be dominant or incongruous to the surrounding area.

- The local Member stated that it was a minor adjustment to the plan and supported the application.

It was proposed by County Councillor J. Becker and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DM/2019/01839 be approved subject to the 14 conditions as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01839 be approved subject to the 14 conditions as outlined in the report.

12. Application DM/2019/01879 - Alterations to outbuilding for use as a holiday let. The Haven, Gypsy Crescent, Llanfoist, Abergavenny

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- The application is now presented as an ancillary outbuilding to the main dwelling rather than as a holiday let and therefore, a householder planning application.
- An additional condition would be required to ensure that the building is used for ancillary purposes to the dwelling known as The Haven.
- The objections to the application were related to its use as a holiday let.
- The building is a substantial improvement on what was previously in place.

In light of the new information received, it was proposed by County Councillor G. Howard and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DM/2019/01879 be approved as an ancillary domestic outbuilding and not as a holiday let and that it be subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report. Also, that an additional condition be added to ensure that the building is used for ancillary purposes to the dwelling known as The Haven.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	11
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01879 be approved as an ancillary domestic outbuilding and not as a holiday let and that it be subject to the five conditions as outlined in the report. Also, that an additional condition be added to ensure that the building is used for ancillary purposes to the dwelling known as The Haven.

13. Application DM/2020/00023 - Erection of 8 no. one-bedroom mews dwellings, landscaped car parking and amenity area, electrical charging point and associated works. Garages at Western Avenue, Bulwark, Chepstow

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the 10 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement as well as a being subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- In excess of 20 trees are being planted across the site which will enhance the site visually.
- The proposed development will enhance the site and be an improvement to the area.
- Concern was expressed that the properties might not age well over time.
- There are areas of the site with no natural surveillance which could lead to antisocial behaviour in the area.
- A condition could be added to provide low bollard lighting within the area.

It was proposed by County Councillor D. Dovey and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DM/2020/00023 be approved subject to the 10 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement, as well as being subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement. Also, that the revised conditions as outlined in late correspondence be added as well as providing an additional condition to provide a lighting scheme for the site covering peripheral areas and walkways.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 3rd March, 2020 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

In favour of the proposal	-	9
Against the proposal	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2020/00023 be approved subject to the 10 conditions as outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement, as well as being subject to a Unilateral Undertaking agreement. Also, that the revised conditions as outlined in late correspondence be added as well as providing an additional condition to provide a lighting scheme for the site covering peripheral areas and walkways.

The meeting ended at 5.54 pm.