

Application Number: DM/2019/01672

Proposal: Proposed sub-division of existing dwelling into two residential units.

Address: The Courtyard, Carrow Road, Carrow Hill, Caerwent

Applicant: Mrs. Margaret Reynish

Plans: All Proposed Plans 1255.03 - , All Proposed Plans 1255.04 - , Location Plan 1255.05 - ,

RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE

Case Officer: Mrs. Helen Hinton

Date Valid: 15.10.2019

This application is presented to Planning Committee as the applicant is a close relative of an Elected Member

1.0 APPLICATION DETAILS

1.1 This application seeks full permission for the subdivision of an existing five bedroom dwelling to create two properties, one three bed and one two bedroom at The Courtyard, Carrow Road, Carrow Hill.

1.2 The dwelling the subject of the application is a large detached property, formerly an agricultural barn granted consent for conversion in 1989 via application 30595, situated in the hamlet known as Carrow Hill. In 2006, the dwelling was granted planning permission via application DC/2006/00679 for the development of a two storey garage/ annexe linked to the eastern elevation of the original dwelling via a glazed porch. As part of the current application it is proposed that the link be removed and the units separated.

1.3 As approved and developed the main dwelling comprises two former agricultural barns arranged in an L-shape, with internal accommodation comprising a kitchen, lounge, dining room, bedroom and bathroom at ground floor with two bedrooms both with en-suite and a study area at first floor level.

1.4 The linked extension originally accommodated a double garage with utility room and w.c. at ground floor level with two en-suite bedrooms at first floor level set within the eaves and roof space of the building. In 2017, a certificate of lawfulness was granted via application DC/2017/00763 to replace the existing timber garage door with full height windows. As part of that application the internal garage space was indicated as being used as additional living space.

1.5 As part of the current application the glazed porch that links the buildings would be removed. Access to the main dwelling would be gained via the existing principal access in the southern elevation, with access to the separated unit gained via the existing doorway in the western (side) elevation.

1.6 The site layout plans also indicate the provision of a new boundary (indicated as being fence and hedging) to the north and south of the buildings to provide separate curtilage spaces. A former field access alongside the eastern side of the plot has also been included within the red line of the application site and would be used as the point of access to Carrow Road for the two bedroom unit and would form part of the residential curtilage for the two bedroom dwelling. The site layout indicates that a parking area capable of accommodating two and three cars to serve the

resulting dwellings and an area of garden would be provided to the south (front) of each building. The existing point of access for the main dwelling would be maintained.

1.7 Private area of amenity space would be provided to the north (rear) of each dwelling.

1.8 In 2017, planning permission was granted for the development of a new detached garage to the north (rear) of the main dwelling, with access gained from the lane to the west of the site (Application DC/2017/00766 refers).

Site Appraisal

1.9 The site as whole is located in an area of open countryside, beyond the closest development boundary as defined by the proposals map of the Monmouthshire Local Development Plan (LDP), within the community of Caerwent. The buildings the subject of the current application are set above the level of the Carrow Road - an adopted but unclassified highway to the south but are roughly level with the dwellings known as The Court House and Home View to the west and east respectively.

2.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY (if any)

Reference Number	Description	Decision	Decision Date
DC/2017/00766	New detached garage.	Approved	18.09.2017
30595	Rehabilitation/Conversion Of Existing Barns To Residential Use.	Approved	15.06.1989
DC/2006/00679	Extensions to existing property and retention of adjacent agricultural land as garden/residential curtilage	Approved	06.10.2006
DC/2017/00763	Replacement of existing timber garage doors with new sliding folding glazed windows	Approved	03.08.2017
28929	Rehabilitation/Conversion Of Existing Barns To Residential Use.	Refused	02.06.1988

3.0 LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES

Strategic Policies

S1 LDP The Spatial Distribution of New Housing Provision

S4 LDP Affordable Housing Provision

S13 LDP Landscape, Green Infrastructure and the Natural Environment
S16 LDP Transport
S17 LDP Place Making and Design

Development Management Policies

H4 LDP Conversion/Rehabilitation of Buildings in the Open Countryside for Residential Use
LC1 LDP New Built Development in the Open Countryside
DES1 LDP General Design Considerations
EP1 LDP Amenity and Environmental Protection
GI1 LDP Green Infrastructure
NE1 LDP Nature Conservation and Development
MV1 LDP Proposed Developments and Highway Considerations

4.0 NATIONAL PLANNING POLICY

Planning Policy Wales (PPW) Edition 10

The primary objective of PPW is to ensure that the planning system contributes towards the delivery of sustainable development and improves the social, economic, environmental and cultural well-being as required by the Planning (Wales) Act 2015, the Well-being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 and other key legislation. A well-functioning planning system is fundamental for sustainable development and achieving sustainable places.

The planning system should create sustainable places that are attractive, sociable, accessible, active, secure, welcoming, healthy and friendly. Development proposals should create the conditions to bring people together, making them want to live, work and play in areas with a sense of place and well-being, creating prosperity for all.

5.0 REPRESENTATIONS

5.1 Consultation Replies

Caerwent Community Council - Recommend approval

MCC Highways - Raise no objections

Dwr Cymru/ Welsh Water - conditions recommended with regards to the disposal of surface water from the site.

5.2 Neighbour Notification

The application has been advertised by direct neighbour notification and the erection of a site notice. No objections or representation have been received.

6.1 EVALUATION

6.2 Strategic & Spatial Choices

6.2.1 Principle of Development

The site lies outside of any town or village development boundary as defined by the proposals maps of the LDP. Strategic policy S1 seeks to enable the acceptable sub-division of existing dwellings, subject to detailed planning consideration.

Although no longer an agricultural building, the requirements of policy H4 - Conversion / Rehabilitation of Buildings in the Open Countryside for Residential Use - are considered relevant to the proposal.

As specified the main dwelling is a pair of former agricultural barns granted consent for conversion to residential use in 1989, with the new build extension/ garage building approved in 2006. Aerial photographs indicate that external works of the extension were completed prior to late summer of 2010. Given the established use as residential accommodation and the size, scale and internal layout of the buildings, it is considered that the property is capable of subdivision and use as independent dwellings without demolition, reconstruction or significant alteration.

Based on aerial photographs it is evident that the annexe building has been on site since at least late summer 2010 and is therefore likely to have been used for its intended purpose approaching, or possibly more than, 10 years. Despite being a modern building, being mindful of its extant use, it is considered that the structure is of a high quality and building standard capable of conversion. The design and external appearance warrant its retention in compliance with the requirements of criterion e) of policy H4.

In light of the above and being mindful of the traditional form and design of the main dwelling and the design of the annexe which seeks to replicate the traditional features of the main dwelling, it is considered that the buildings warrant retention and the principle of subdividing the property to provide two dwellings is considered compliant with the requirements of policies S1 and H4 of the LDP subject to the application satisfying a number of material considerations.

6.2.2 Good Design/ Place making

As specified above, with the exception of the removal of the glass link extension, the works of subdivision and conversion would take place within the existing fabric of the buildings with no further extensions or alterations proposed to the external appearance of either building.

When originally approved for conversion and development, the buildings were sympathetically designed with external materials to maintain the character of an agricultural building and respect the wider rural landscape. Although the proposal would create a smaller two bedroom dwelling a little at odds with the size and scale of the dwellings closest to the site, the proposal would help diversify the housing stock in the immediate area, which on the whole would be respectful and in keeping with the local vernacular, character and appearance of the area in compliance with the relevant requirements of policies H4, EP1 and DES1 of the LDP.

6.2.3 Impact on Amenity/ Promoting Healthier Places

The buildings the subject of the current application, are positioned approximately 12.5m to the north of Carrow Road, approximately 8m and 3m, behind the principal elevations of The Court House and Home View respectively.

Whilst the eastern (side) elevation of the two bedroom unit does contain two windows at ground floor level serving the living room space, overlooking the garden of Home View, this is an existing arrangement. Therefore it is considered that the application proposed would not generate an intensified level of overlooking or loss of privacy relative to the existing arrangement. If deemed necessary a condition could be imposed requiring the provision of new planting along the eastern boundary of the site, to safeguard the privacy and amenity of Home View further. Conditions could also be imposed on any grant of consent removing permitted development rights for the insertion of windows and development of extensions in order to protect the residential amenity of Home View further and to control future development at the site. Subject to the imposition of such conditions the application is considered compliant with the requirements of policies DES1 and EP1 of the LDP.

6.2 Active and Social Places

6.2.1 Affordable Housing

In accordance with the requirements of strategic policy S4 of the LDP, all residential developments (including at the scale of a single dwelling) should contribute to the provision of affordable housing in the local planning area, although this is subject to the viability of each individual scheme.

In accordance with the Council's adopted Affordable Housing Supplementary Planning Guidance 2019, the commuted sum contribution associated with the new two bedroom unit (as this would form the new dwelling) would be £6,264. Confirmation that the applicant is willing to enter into a Section 106 Agreement in order to make the contribution has been sought. Subject to the applicant entering into the agreement, the proposal would be compliant with the requirements of policy S4 of the LDP.

6.2.2 Access / Highway Safety

Due to its rural location, the site will be principally accessed via private vehicle. The site layout plan submitted indicates that the each building would benefit from its own independent access and parking area with the original dwelling having three parking space and the two bedroom unit 2 spaces with the garden to the south (front) of the buildings. Although the development would create two independent dwellings, no increase of bedroom numbers is proposed. It is therefore considered that relative to the existing arrangement, there would be no material increase in the number of vehicle movements generated by the development and that the highway network adjacent to the site is capable of accommodating the movements associated.

Following consideration of the details submitted, the Council's Highway department has raised no objection to the application noting that the provision is in line with the requirements of the adopted Monmouthshire Parking Standards (January 2013). In light of the above the application is considered compliant with the requirements of policies S16 and MV1 of the LDP.

6.3 Productive and Enterprising Places

6.3.1 Economic Development and tourism

Criterion g) of policy H4 of the LDP specifies that conversion and adaptation of buildings to residential use that are well suited for business use will not be permitted unless the applicant has made every reasonable attempt to secure suitable business use and the application is supported by a statement of the efforts that have been made.

Being mindful of the annex's established use as additional residential accommodation; the site's relatively isolated location; the limited width of the highway infrastructure leading to the site and the building's positioning relative to the main dwelling and the neighbouring properties either side, it is considered unlikely that the building would be suitable for an alternative commercial use such as a workshop. However, it would be possible for it to be used as holiday accommodation with little disruption to the applicant and neighbouring dwellings.

A request for additional information with regards to marketing and potential alternative uses has been sought from the applicant's agent and will be reported verbally to Members.

6.4 Distinctive & Natural Places

6.4.1 Landscape/ Visual Impact

Given the existing design, size and scale of the buildings in associations with their recessed and staggered position relative to the established building lines of the properties either side, it is considered that the development would continue to form part of and integrate with dwellings in Carrow Hill and would not have a detrimental impact on the overall character, appearance, landscape or visual amenity of the application site or wider area. The proposal is therefore considered compliant with the relevant requirements of policies S17, EP1 and DES1 of the LDP.

6.4.2 Biodiversity

Being mindful that the proposal is purely for the subdivision of the property which is in active residential use and does not seek any further extensions or alterations to the building, a bat survey was not requested. In contrast the removal of the glass link porch between the buildings, with its

associated light spill, could have a beneficial impact on the foraging and commuting routes of species of conservation concern within the area.

Being mindful that the proposal seeks to provide additional soft landscaping and green infrastructure through the provision of additional hedge planting between the dwellings, subject to a condition requiring the planting schedule to be agreed, it is considered that the proposal could have a beneficial impact on the biodiversity and ecological value of the area and is compliant with the requirements of policies S13, GI1 and NE1 of the LDP.

6.4.3 Water (including foul drainage / SuDS)

Details submitted indicate that foul water from each dwelling would be disposed of via an existing septic tank. Following consultation Dwr Cymru/ Welsh Water have recommended conditions with regards to the disposal of surface water from the site. This is an existing converted building and the surface water would be drained via the existing arrangement.

6.5 Response to the Representations of Third Parties and/or Community/Town Council

6.5.1 Following consultation the Caerwent Community Council have recommended the application be approved. Following direct neighbour notification and the erection of a site notice, no objections or representations have been received.

6.6 Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015

6.6.1 The duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales has been considered, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under section 3 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (the WBFG Act). In reaching this recommendation, the ways of working set out at section 5 of the WBFG Act have been taken into account and it is considered that this recommendation is in accordance with the sustainable development principle through its contribution towards one or more of the Welsh Ministers' well-being objectives set out in section 8 of the WBFG Act.

6.7 Conclusion

6.7.1 Having regard to the above report, it is considered that the building is capable of subdivision to provide two dwellings without significant extension or alteration; the design and scale of the resulting buildings would respect the form, character and appearance of the original building; and the development would not have a detrimental impact on the residential amenity of those living closest to the site or the highway safety and free flow of traffic in the area.

On the basis of the above, the application is considered compliant with the relevant criteria of policies S1, S4, S13, S17, H4, GI1, NE1, EP1, EP5, MV1, DES1 LC1, MV1 and SD4 of the Monmouthshire County Council Local Development Plan and is recommended for approval subject to conditions.

7.0 RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE

Subject to a 106 Legal Agreement requiring the following:
S106 Heads of Terms

Provision of a commuted sum of £6,264 towards the provision of affordable housing within the County.

If the S106 Agreement is not signed within 6 months of the Planning Committee's resolution then delegated powers be granted to officers to refuse the application.

Conditions:

1 This development shall be begun within 5 years from the date of this permission.
REASON: To comply with Section 91 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990.

2 The development shall be carried out in accordance with the list of approved plans set out in the table below.

REASON: To ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the approved drawings, for the avoidance of doubt.

3 Notwithstanding the provisions of Article 3, Schedule 2, Part 1 Classes A B C D E F & H of the Town and Country Planning (General Permitted Development)(Amendment)(Wales) Order 2013 (or any Order revoking and re-enacting that Order with or without modification) no enlargements, improvements or other alterations to the dwellinghouse or any outbuildings shall be erected or constructed.

REASON: In the interests of the privacy and residential amenity of those living closest to the site and the character and visual amenity of the application site and wider area, in accordance with LDP policies H4, DES1 and EP1.

4 Notwithstanding the details of the approved plans, prior to the commencement of development, details of enhanced soft landscaping and boundary details along the eastern boundary of the site shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

REASON: In the interests of protecting and enhancing the residential amenity of those living closest to the site in accordance with LDP policies EP1 and DES1.

5 Notwithstanding the details of the approved plans, prior to the commencement of development a scheme of landscaping, to include detailed boundary information and planting schedule shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The details shall include indications of all existing trees and hedgerows on the land, and details of any to be retained, together with measures for their protection in the course of the development.

REASON: To safeguard the landscape amenities of the area and to ensure compliance with LDP Policy GI1.

6 All planting, seeding or turfing comprised in the approved details of landscaping shall be carried out in the first planting and seeding season following the occupation of the buildings or the completion of the development, whichever is the sooner, and any trees or plants which within a period of 5 years from the completion of the development die, are removed or become seriously damaged or diseased shall be replaced in the next planting season with others of similar size and species.

REASON: To safeguard the landscape amenities of the area and to ensure compliance with LDP Policy GI1.