

DC/2017/00651

ERECTION OF A TWO-STOREY ANNEXE

40A MAIN ROAD, PORTSKEWETT

OFFICER RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE
COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION: REFUSE

Case Officer: Nia Watts
Date registered: 28/06/2017

1.0 APPLICATION DETAILS

1.1 This application was initially presented to planning committee on the 7th November 2017 with a recommendation of approval and following some decorative design alterations was re-presented to Committee on the 5th December 2017 with the same recommendation of approval. Following the design amendments Members still felt the design was incongruous in respect of the existing parent dwelling within the site and detracted from the character and appearance of the existing dwelling and the surrounding area, contrary to DES1 c) of the Monmouthshire Local Development Plan. The orientation of the roof was at odds with the main dwelling and its detachment from the main house via a link appeared visually weak. It was considered that an alternative design re-configuring the roof to reflect that of the main house with dormers in the roof and a lower roof height would ensure the proposed annexe was more visually sympathetic to the house. Attaching the annexe to the house would also make the overall design more coherent. Members resolved that the application should be refused on design grounds and the application is now re-presented to Committee with a reason for refusal.

1.2 The following reason for refusal is presented:

The proposed annexe by virtue of its size and design would create an incongruous and jarring form of development in relation to the setting of the parent dwelling which fails to preserve the appearance and character of that setting and of the surrounding area. The development is therefore contrary to Strategic Policy S17 and Development Management Policy DES1 c) of the Monmouthshire Local Development Plan.

PREVIOUS REPORT 05/12/2017

1.1 This application was previously presented to Planning Committee on 7th November 2017 with an officer recommendation for approval. However, Members expressed concern regarding the design as it was not considered to relate well to the main house. It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R.J. Higginson that consideration of application DC/2017/00651 should be deferred to a future meeting of the Planning Committee to allow officers to liaise with the applicant with a view to agreeing a more appropriate design.

1.2 Since then an amended plan (drawing no. 162404 Rev 8) has been received which indicates decorative amendments to the proposed annexe, featuring re-constituted stone quoins, lintels and cills, and overhanging eaves and barge boards to match the existing dwelling house. It was again advised by officers to make other design alterations including options to reduce the height of the annexe to single storey and compensate by increasing the floor area, position the annexe further away from the boundary with the neighbours of Hill Barn View (by attaching the annexe to the main dwelling), or explore converting the existing garage to annexe accommodation. These

design suggestions were not agreed and the applicant wishes Committee to consider the annexe with the same dimensions and profile as presented in the previous committee meeting.

- 1.3 The application is therefore once again presented to Planning Committee with the same style annexe proposal with alterations to the decorative nature of the building so it is more in keeping with the existing dwelling.

PREVIOUS REPORT 07/11/2017

1.0 APPLICATION DETAILS

1.1 40a Main Road is large detached dwelling and forms part of two new dwellings built under the scheme DC/2007/01327. These dwellings are located away from the main street scene behind No. 40 and Hollyberry House and share a driveway. No. 40A has its principal elevation facing east. To the south of the site are properties in Hill Barn View and the rear gardens of No's 20, 21 and 22 bound onto the southern boundary of 40A. It is proposed to erect a two storey annexe building to the south (side) elevation of the house measuring approximately 5.3m by 8.3m by 5.8m high. The scheme has been amended to remove a roof light from the annexe. It has also been requested that the proposal is amended to reduce the height of the annexe; this has been reduced from 6.1m to the ridge to 5.8m and the annexe has been made wider with the roof pitch becoming less steep

1.2 The scheme was considered at a Delegation Panel meeting on Tuesday 26th September whereby Members resolved to request that the application was presented to Planning Committee; Members were not satisfied regarding the impact of the proposal upon neighbouring properties' amenity and were also concerned about the visual impact of the proposal. It was felt the proposal was an overdevelopment of the plot. It was considered that it would be preferable to convert the existing large double garage into annexe accommodation. Following this, the applicant was advised to reduce the size of the annexe further and re-present the design as a single storey annexe building. The plans however have not been altered and the application wishes to pursue the design presented at the Delegation Panel.

2.0 RELEVANT PLANNING HISTORY

DC/2007/01327 – 2 No. dwellings with garages (Reserved matters)
Approved 25.07.2008

3.0 LOCAL DEVELOPMENT PLAN POLICIES

S17 Place making and design
DES1 General Design Considerations

S13 Landscape, Green Infrastructure and the Natural Environment
EP1 Amenity and Environmental Protection

4.0 REPRESENTATIONS

4.1 Consultation Responses

Portskewett Community Council – recommends refusal. Concerns with regards to the proximity of the proposed development to the perimeter fence of the property and the impact this will have upon neighbouring residences. Also concerns raised regarding the size of the proposed development in relation to the existing dwelling.

Glamorgan Gwent Archaeological Trust – no objections.

Welsh Water – draws attention to a public sewer that runs across the site.

4.2 Neighbour Representations

Three letters of objection have been received from the properties to the rear No's. 20, 21 and 22 Hill Barn View. No. 21 has also written in with concerns in relation to the amended drawings

The following concerns have been raised:

- Annexe extremely close to the boundary fence - affecting privacy, overlooking and blocking sunlight.
- The house has not been built in accordance with the plans, (being built parallel rather than at an angle) which results in train noise resonating round my back garage – the annexe proposal will exacerbate this.
- Amendments have not changed initial concerns.

A letter of support has also been received from someone in the locality with comments that he is supportive of a proposal which facilitates people to look after their elderly parents.

4.3 Local Member representations – concerns about the proximity of the building towards the shared boundary with neighbouring properties and questions the need for a two storey building as accommodation for the elderly is usually on the ground floor.

5.0 EVALUATION

5.1 Principle of proposal

5.1.1 40a Main Road is located within Portskewett's development boundary which allows in principle for annexe development to share the primary facilities of the existing dwelling house, such as the garden and parking area providing there is an acceptable impact on visual amenity and neighbour amenity.

5.2 Impact on Visual Amenity

5.2.1 40a Main Road is set away from the streetscene and cannot be seen from Main Road. The annexe is to be located to the south elevation and would be largely obscured by the existing dwelling house. Although there are concerns a new building in this location is overdevelopment of the plot, it is considered that visually the annexe will have a limited impact on the wider area in that it cannot be seen within the public street scene and there is enough space to accommodate such a new outbuilding. Visually the annexe will appear subservient to the main dwelling house. It is considered that the visual impact of the proposal is acceptable.

5.3 Impact on Neighbour Amenity

5.3.1 It is considered that in relation to the residential amenity impact of the proposal, the annexe will have an acceptable impact. Although it is appreciated it is sited in close proximity to the rear boundaries of the neighbouring dwellings approximately 800mm away, 40a Main Road is set a lower level, approximately 1.1m lower than the neighbouring properties 20, 21 and 22 Hill Barn View. The annex would project 2.7m to the eaves from the ground level of Hill Barn View, projecting approximately 1m above the existing fence screen. The overall height of the annexe to the ridge line is 5.8m (from the ground level of 40A Main Road) and 4.8m from the ground level of Hill View Barn but from the eaves the roof line will taper back from the fence boundary. Although there will be a large mass above the fence line, this is common in mid to high density residential areas whereby residential properties have

outbuildings up to the boundary. There are permitted development allowances to erect an outbuilding up to 2.5m high to the eaves and up to 4m to the ridge height. Comparatively this proposal is 2.7m to the eaves and 4.8m to the ridge height from the ground level of Hill View Barn's rear gardens. The resultant impact therefore is not considered to be significantly overbearing to warrant the refusal of the application.

5.3.2 In terms of overlooking there will be minimal impact towards No's 20, 21 and 22 Hill Barn View as no first floor windows or roof lights are proposed to the rear (south) elevation. The proposed first floor windows to the end gable elevations which are to serve a bathroom and stairway (non-habitable rooms) will have oblique views into these gardens. A condition will also ensure they are obscure glazed to ensure no direct overlooking occurs towards the rear garden area of No.19 Hill Barn View.

5.3.3 Overall the consideration of this application takes into account the effect of the proposal on local residential amenity. While acknowledging residents' concerns, it is considered that the limited harm caused to local amenity by the proposal is not so significant as to be unacceptable in planning terms and the proposal would not affect the peaceful enjoyment of the neighbouring properties or their privacy. The proposed annexe is considered to be in accordance with policies S13, S17 DES1 and EP1 of the Local Development Plan.

5.4 Response to the Community Council's and Local Members representations

5.4.1 In response to the Community Council's representations regarding concerns about proximity of the proposed annexe to boundaries and the size of the proposal, these are addressed in the previous sections, above.

5.4.2 In terms of why it has been designed as a two storey outbuilding, the agent has stated that this was to avoid a larger ground floor build and the first floor accommodation was to make use of the roof space. Although a single storey development would limit the amenity impact (and this option has been requested) the applicant has not agreed to amend the plans. Despite this, it is not felt in this instance that the two storey development is significantly overbearing enough to warrant its refusal. It is stated the occupiers will be the parents of the owners of 40a and a condition will ensure that it can only be lived in as annexe (ancillary) accommodation by family members who require the support of the household living in the main dwelling house. It cannot be rented or lived in by somebody independent of the family and not dependent on the main house.

5.5 Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015

5.5.1 The duty to improve the economic, social, environmental and cultural well-being of Wales has been considered, in accordance with the sustainable development principle, under section 3 of the Well-Being of Future Generations (Wales) Act 2015 (the WBFG Act). In reaching this recommendation, the ways of working set out at section 5 of the WBFG Act have been taken into account and it is considered that this recommendation is in accordance with the sustainable development principle through its contribution towards one or more of the Welsh Ministers' well-being objectives set out in section 8 of the WBFG Act.

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: APPROVE

Conditions

1	This development shall be begun within 5 years from the date of this permission.
---	--

2	The development shall be carried out in accordance with the list of approved plans set out in the table below.
	<u>Compliance conditions</u>
3.	The annexe accommodation hereby approved shall not be occupied otherwise than for purposes ancillary to the residential use of the existing dwelling.
4.	The bathroom window in the west elevation and the stairway window in the east elevation shall be obscure glazed to a level equivalent to Pilkington scale of obscurity level 3 and maintained thus thereafter in perpetuity.

Informatives

The proposed development site is crossed by a public sewer. The applicant may need to apply for any connection to the public sewer under S106 of the Water Industry Act 1991. For further information, the applicant is advised to contact Welsh Water on 0800 917 2652.