

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee

County Hall, Usk - Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 7th September, 2021 at 2.00 pm

PRESENT: County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: J. Becker, L. Brown, A. Davies, A. Easson,
D. Evans, J. Higginson, G. Howard, P. Jordan, P. Murphy, M. Powell,
A. Webb and S. Woodhouse

OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Amy Longford	Development Management Area Team Manager
Denzil – John Turbervill	Commercial Solicitor
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

APOLOGIES:

County Councillors M. Feakins and R. Harris

1. Declarations of Interest

None received.

2. Confirmation of Minutes

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 3rd August 2021 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

3. Application DM/2019/00799 - To provide a pre-school educational facility, to inform young children about the natural environment by providing safe, natural outside space for supervised walks and activities. In addition, the provision of two holiday let timber pods to provide sleeping accommodation for guests, plus chemical toilet and rain shelter. Field Nos. 5735 And 4455, Whitecastle, NP7 8UD

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 11 conditions outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the report the following points were identified:

- In response to questions raised, it was noted that children will be dropped off at the pre-school educational facility for periods of three to four hours per day with a maximum of 12 children present at any given time.
- With regard to there being only one toilet facility, one shared facility had been deemed appropriate to serve the pre-school educational facility and the holiday

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee

County Hall, Usk - Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 7th September, 2021 at 2.00 pm

accommodation. However, due to the modest numbers of children and holiday makers and that the children would only be present for certain periods of the day, it had been considered by Planning officers that this arrangement would be acceptable.

- The application is retrospective. No enforcement action has been served as the current application is the result of the enforcement investigation phase of the enforcement case.
- Pre-school children would be closely monitored by qualified staff when using all facilities on the site.
- It was noted that a condition could be added that any built element on the site that ceases its approved use is then removed from the site within a specific timescale.

It was proposed by County Councillor R. Edwards and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DM/2019/00799 be approved subject to the 11 conditions outlined in the report and also subject to an additional condition:

- That any built element on the site that ceases its approved use is then removed from the site within a specific timescale.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00799 be approved subject to the 11 conditions outlined in the report and also subject to an additional condition:

- That any built element on the site that ceases its approved use is then removed from the site within a specific timescale.

4. Application DM/2020/00636 - Sheep housing / general purpose agricultural building. Henrhiw Farm, Monkswood, Usk

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the eight conditions outlined in the report.

The local Member for Llanbadoc, attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair, outlined the following points:

- Concern was expressed that the ground between Henrhiw Farm and the Barns might have been separated.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee

County Hall, Usk - Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 7th September, 2021 at 2.00 pm

- The two sheds that have been agreed were officer delegated decisions some time ago.
- Concern was expressed that the height of the proposed buildings would be excessive for a rural location and questioned whether such a building was required for sheep farming.
- The whole site needs to be re-evaluated.
- The application for the residential caravan on the site is to be located one mile away and is detached from Henrhiw Farm.
- It was considered that the bunding on the site had not been agreed.
- A section of the application site is located on unauthorised hardstanding. It was considered that the application should therefore not be approved.
- The local Member asked that the Planning Committee defer consideration of the application to undertake a full review of the proposal and hold a site inspection.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, the following points were noted:

- The existing building is being used for agricultural purposes and storage of equipment.
- The proposed new building is required as the existing buildings are not fit for purpose for the expansion of the sheep flock. The proposed building needs to be a certain height to allow for ventilation and would aid in the expansion of this enterprise.
- The enterprise is a separate unit from the main farm.
- Some Members considered that a site inspection would be beneficial before determining the application.
- Approval of the application will authorise the element of hardstanding outlined in the report.
- Sheep are only indoors for a limited period of time. Poly tunnels are an alternative option for use at lambing time.

The local Member summed up by expressing her support for a poly tunnel at the site instead of the proposed additional agricultural building.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor D. Evans that application DM/2020/00636 be approved subject to the eight conditions outlined in the report.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee

County Hall, Usk - Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 7th September, 2021 at 2.00 pm

It was also proposed by County Councillor A. Webb and seconded by County Councillor S. Woodhouse that we be minded to defer consideration of application DM/2020/00636 to allow the Planning Committee to hold a site inspection before re-presenting the application to a future Planning Committee for determination.

The Planning Committee firstly considered the proposition to approve the application, as follows:

For approval	-	7
Against approval	-	7
Abstentions	-	0

The vote was tied. Therefore, the Chair exercised her casting vote and voted against approval.

The proposition was not carried.

The Planning Committee considered the proposition to defer the application to hold a site inspection before re-presenting the application to a future Planning Committee for determination.

For deferral	-	10
Against deferral	-	3
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that we be minded to defer consideration of application DM/2020/00636 to allow the Planning Committee to hold a site inspection before re-presenting the application to a future Planning Committee for determination.

5. Application DM/2021/00724 - Proposed new build detached dwelling to side of No. 2 Ifton Road, Ty Newydd, 2 Ifton Road, Rogiet, NP26 3SS

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Agreement.

In noting the detail of the application the following points were identified:

- The site was considered to be too small to accommodate the proposed new dwelling and would result in overdevelopment of the site.
- The road is too narrow and is already congested. An additional property on the site with additional vehicles parking there would further exacerbate the congestion issue.

MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee

County Hall, Usk - Remote Attendance on Tuesday, 7th September, 2021 at 2.00 pm

- The value of the host property could be diminished if this application was approved. There is less than one metre distance between the host property and the proposed new dwelling.
- Concern was expressed regarding the amenity of the single storey structure regarding the windows. It was considered that there would be a negative impact regarding the outlook from those windows.
- The Development Management Area Manager informed the Committee that the issues of overbearing and suitability of the plot for a dwelling, size and scale are subjective matters. There are no specific set of measurements / plot sizes set out in the Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG).

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor G. Howard that we be minded to refuse application DM/2021/00724 on the grounds that the proposed dwelling would result in over development of the plot and that it would be detrimental to the amenity of neighbouring properties.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	13
Against refusal	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that we be minded to refuse application DM/2021/00724 on the grounds that the proposed dwelling would result in over development of the plot and that it would be detrimental to the amenity of neighbouring properties.

6. FOR INFORMATION - The Planning Inspectorate - Appeals Decisions Received:

6.1. Bushes Farm, Earlswood

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at Bushes Farm, Earlswood on 29th June 2021.

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

The meeting ended at 3.29 pm.