

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Remote Meeting on Tuesday, 7th July, 2020 at 2.00 pm

**PRESENT:** County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)  
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: L.Brown, A.Davies, D. Dovey, A. Easson,  
D. Evans, M.Feakins, R. Harris, J. Higginson, G. Howard, P. Murphy,  
M. Powell, A. Webb and S. Woodhouse

#### **OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Amy Longford	Development Management Area Team Manager
Denzil – John Turbervill	Commercial Solicitor
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

#### **APOLOGIES:**

None.

#### **1. Declarations of Interest**

County Councillor R. Edwards declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of applications DM/2019/02081 and DM/2020/00070 as the applicants were family members. She therefore left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

#### **2. Application DM/2019/00225 - Erection of a rural enterprise worker's dwelling and associated equestrian unit for dressage training and livery combined with change of use from golf course to equestrian use. Alice Springs Golf Club, Kemeys Road, Kemeys Commander**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report and late correspondence with an additional condition to require the dwelling to be occupied only after certain key buildings or infrastructure are already completed.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- The shower amenity for the workers should be separate from the house itself and be attached to one of the buildings or the garage.
- Concern was expressed that neither the functional need test nor the financial test have been met.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Remote Meeting on Tuesday, 7th July, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- Concern was expressed that if the venture failed, permission would be granted for a new affordable property in the countryside.
- The location of the manure waste storage area should be agreed with the Local Planning Authority before any buildings are occupied and the manure waste should only be deposited in that agreed location.
- Concern was expressed that the independent assessment considered that the various tests had not been met.
- It would be beneficial to the Planning Committee if it could visit the site.
- The Development Services Manager informed the Committee that the application is being treated as a new dwelling on an established enterprise. It was considered that the application does meet the function and financial test notwithstanding the comments of the Council's independent assessor. It was considered that there were mitigating circumstances which led to the officer recommendation to approve the application. With regard to the financial test, the figures presented justify the test being met. There are labour requirements for 2.28 workers so approval of the application would satisfy one of those workers. There are welfare reasons outlined in the report identifying why a worker should be residing on site. Also, security issues come into play with regard to some higher end uses in this instance. Should the venture fail, the dwelling would be available for another rural enterprise. If none of these conditions were met it would then become an offer as an affordable housing unit. The size of the dwelling is 184 sq.m which is not considered to be excessive. The landscape impact is acceptable and the scale of the enterprise means that this size of dwelling would be suitable in this location.
- The Head of Planning informed the Committee that this is being treated as a new dwelling for an established enterprise. Evidence has been provided establishing a functional and financial need for the development to be located on this site. TAN 6 is very supportive towards rural enterprise and businesses.
- This is a better site than the current location. It would be purpose built and be a valuable facility located within the countryside.
- Some Members considered the property would be a good size built to a high standard.
- Other Members expressed concern regarding the size of the dwelling and that would be larger than necessary. It would be 184 sq.m but would exclude the office and the shower. It was considered that these should be separate from the proposed dwelling.
- Concern was expressed regarding the financial tests that had been undertaken.
- The Head of Planning informed the Committee that with regard to the scale of dwelling, there is no Welsh Government Guidance regarding the scale of the

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Remote Meeting on Tuesday, 7th July, 2020 at 2.00 pm

development in terms of an agricultural workers dwelling. Each application would be considered on a case by case basis. It was considered that the financial test had been met in terms of the need for full time worker.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DM/2019/00225 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and late correspondence with an additional condition to require the dwelling to be occupied only after certain key buildings or infrastructure are already completed. A further condition be added so that the location of the manure waste storage area shall be agreed with the Local Planning Authority before any buildings are occupied and the manure waste shall only be deposited in that agreed location.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	9
Against approval	-	6
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00225 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and late correspondence with an additional condition to require the dwelling to be occupied only after certain key buildings or infrastructure are already completed. A further condition be added so that the location of the manure waste storage area shall be agreed with the Local Planning Authority before any buildings are occupied and the manure waste shall only be deposited in that agreed location.

### **3. Application DM/2019/00332 - Farm worker's dwelling. New Farm Workers Dwelling, Whitecastle Road, Whitecastle, Llantilio Crossenny, Monmouthshire**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 12 conditions outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application the following points were identified:

- A single storey building would be most appropriate.
- Discussion ensued regarding whether a condition should be added in addition to the size limits at the outline stage. However, it was considered that this matter should be addressed at the reserved matters stage.
- There is no statutory guidance on the size of operation and holding verses what size of dwelling is appropriate. Financial tests have been met and the business is sustainable and showing a profit.
- The building is for a maximum of 180 sq.m which could include the need for an office, utility space and garage, which would significantly reduce the internal living space to below 150sq.m.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Remote Meeting on Tuesday, 7th July, 2020 at 2.00 pm

- The Head of Planning informed the Committee that if the landscape allows then perhaps a 1.5 or 2 storey development might be accommodated. However, the parameters outlined were considered to be acceptable with a maximum six metre height being appropriate for this landscape setting.
- The scale parameters provide enough safeguard at the reserve matters stage.
- No additional conditions to be added at the outline application stage. These matters can be addressed at the reserved matters stage.

It was proposed by County Councillor R. Edwards and seconded by County Councillor P. Murphy that application DM/2019/00332 be approved subject to the 12 conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	1
Abstentions	-	2

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/00332 be approved subject to the 12 conditions outlined in the report.

#### **4. Application DM/2019/01062 - Proposed conversion and extension of former cow byre and lambing shed into two residential units 6 & 7. Units 6 And 7 Cayo Farm, Llanvecha Road, Llandenny, Usk**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the eight conditions outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application the following points were identified:

- It was considered that conditions 6 and 7 should be amended to ensure that ecological mitigation is maintained in perpetuity.
- The first two units were created in the farm house which were sub-divided into two units. As part of that application there had been a commuted sum required for an affordable housing contribution. The application for the large barn and for the cow byre and lambing shed now falls under the requirement in the new supplementary planning guidance. Therefore, there are four units in total now that are exempt, so there is no requirement for a financial contribution towards affordable housing provision.

It was proposed by County Councillor R. Harris and seconded by County Councillor G. Howard that application DM/2019/01062 be approved subject to the eight conditions outlined in the report and that conditions 6 and 7 should be amended to ensure that ecological mitigation is maintained in perpetuity.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Remote Meeting on Tuesday, 7th July, 2020 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01062 be approved subject to the eight conditions outlined in the report and that conditions 6 and 7 be amended to ensure that ecological mitigation is maintained in perpetuity.

#### **5. Application DM/2019/01214 - The demolition of the existing corrugated arched tin shed and replacement by a two storey residential dwelling. Land Adjacent To 13 Fosterville Crescent, Abergavenny**

We received the report of the application which was presented for refusal for one reason outlined in the report.

The application had been presented to Planning Committee on 3rd March 2020 with a recommendation for approval. However, this had not been approved by Planning Committee as concern had been expressed regarding the size of the plot and the resulting appearance of the dwelling.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DM/2019/01214 be refused for the one reason outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For refusal	-	10
Against refusal	-	4
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/01214 be refused for the one reason outlined in the report.

#### **6. Application DM/2019/02041 - Proposed 2 storey extension to the present dwelling replacing the existing removed. New House Farm, Little Mill, Monmouthshire, NP4 0UD**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the five conditions outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application it was identified that condition three (ecological conservation) should be amended to ensure implementation of the approved details and then maintenance of the plan's approved actions in perpetuity.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Remote Meeting on Tuesday, 7th July, 2020 at 2.00 pm

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor A. Davies that application DM/2019/02041 be approved subject to the five conditions outlined in the report and that condition 3 (ecological conservation) should be amended to ensure implementation of the approved details and then maintenance of the plan's approved actions in perpetuity.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/02041 be approved subject to the five conditions outlined in the report and that condition 3 (ecological conservation) should be amended to ensure implementation of the approved details and then maintenance of the plan's approved actions in perpetuity.

#### **7. Application DM/2019/02081 - Change of use of barn to B1 use including replacement cladding. Barn to north of Forest View, Penterry Farm, Chapel Hill Road, Penterry, St Arvans**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the seven conditions outlined in the report.

The local Member for St. Arvans, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed her support for the application.

In noting the detail of the application the following points were identified:

- A Member expressed considered that the building would be inappropriate for office accommodation in this isolated location as the proper infrastructure would not be in place. Also, it was considered that Policy RE3 (Agricultural Diversification) should apply in this instance but there does not appear to be a business case put forward to satisfy criterion b) of that policy. Planning Policy Wales (PPW) advises on sustainable locations. This location is unsustainable as there is a need to rely on private vehicular use to access this location.
- In response, the Development Management Area Manager, informed the Committee that there is an agricultural planning statement submitted as part of the application that showed the existing use of the farm and why the building is now redundant. The proposals for office accommodation are not ideal. However, recent events have shown that how we work is changing with more home working likely, going forward. The Authority wants to support rural diversification of farms and the rural economy and it was considered that the proposed application addresses these issues. The benefits outweigh the harm of the location. In terms of the applicable nature of Policies RE2 and RE3, within the application there was an appeal provided in relation to another property in the south of the County where a similar application was submitted. The inspector

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Remote Meeting on Tuesday, 7th July, 2020 at 2.00 pm

had concluded that office accommodation was an appropriate use outside of a main village or town. Therefore, in respect of Policies RE2 and RE3, it was considered that the previous Inspectors recommendations should be applied for this application.

- Concern was expressed regarding lack of visibility when exiting / entering the site.
- Other Members expressed their support for the application.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Feakins and seconded by County Councillor A. Webb that application DM/2019/02081 be approved subject to the seven conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	1
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2019/02081 be approved subject to the seven conditions outlined in the report.

#### **8. Application DM/2020/00070 - Advertisement consent for one freestanding sign, Raglan Farm Park, Chepstow Road, Raglan, NP15 2EN**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the six conditions outlined in the report.

In noting the detail of the application it was proposed by County Councillor D. Evans and seconded by County Councillor M. Feakins that application DM/2020/00070 be approved subject to the six conditions outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	10
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2020/00070 be approved subject to the six conditions outlined in the report.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at Remote Meeting on Tuesday, 7th July, 2020 at 2.00 pm**

#### **9. The Planning Inspectorate - Appeals Decisions received:**

##### **9.1. 10 Yew Tree Wood, Bayfield, Chepstow**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been made on 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2020.

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

##### **9.2. Barn Conversion at 33 Kymin Road, The Kymin, Monmouth – costs**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to a costs decision following a site visit that had been made on 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2020.

We noted that the application for an award of costs was refused.

##### **9.3. Barn Conversion at 33 Kymin Road, The Kymin, Monmouth**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been made on 3<sup>rd</sup> February 2020.

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

##### **9.4. The Lodge, Mount Way, Chepstow**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been made on 28<sup>th</sup> February 2020.

We noted that the appeal had been dismissed.

#### **10. Planning Appeals Received**

We noted the new appeals received between 28<sup>th</sup> January 2020 and 30<sup>th</sup> June 2020.

#### **11. Confirmation of Minutes**

We confirmed the Planning Committee minutes dated 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2020.

**The meeting ended at 4.27 pm.**