

# Public Document Pack

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote  
attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** County Councillor Phil Murphy (Chairman)  
County Councillor Dale Rooke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: Fay Bromfield, Emma Bryn, Jan Butler,  
John Crook, Tony Easson, Steven Garratt, Meirion Howells,  
Su McConnel, Jayne McKenna, Maureen Powell, Sue Riley and  
Ann Webb

County Councillors Catherine Fookes, Penny Jones and Paul Pavia  
attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair.

### **OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Craig O'Connor	Head of Planning
Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Andrew Jones	Development Management Area Team Manager
Amy Longford	Development Management Area Team Manager
Paige Moseley	Solicitor
Richard Williams	Democratic Services Officer

County Councillors J. McKenna and J. Crook left the meeting following determination of application DM/2023/00302 and did not return.

County Councillor A. Easson and S. Riley left the meeting following determination of application DM/2022/01376 and did not return.

### **APOLOGIES:**

County Councillors: Jill Bond and Ben Callard

#### **1. Declarations of Interest**

None received.

#### **2. Confirmation of Minutes**

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 6<sup>th</sup> June 2023 were confirmed and signed by the Chair.

#### **3. Application DM/2023/00550 - Retention of and completion of proposed first floor rear extension. Celebration Cottage, Candwr Road, Ponthir, Monmouthshire, NP181HU**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

The local Member for Llanybi Fawr, also a Planning Committee Member, outlined the following points:

- The area is classed as open countryside.
- The application does not comply with Policy H6 of the Local Development Plan (LDP).
- Officers are satisfied that this application will not have an intrusive appearance. However, photographs in late correspondence and from the site visit indicate that the extension can be seen from the road when entering from Llandegfeth Village.
- This will be an intrusive extension on an already very large property.
- Although the extension is less than 30% of the dwelling, it is still a large extension that will overlook its neighbouring property. It is only 6% less than is considered acceptable within the guidance. A degree of common sense should be applied.
- It may be argued that this application does not comply with the wording of Policy H6 which aims to avoid over extension of existing rural dwellings and the adverse impact this has on the character and appearance of the open countryside.
- Large scale extensions can be harmful if they result in the loss of scale and character of traditional rural dwellings.
- The local Member does not consider the justification that the property has lost its traditionality should be applied.
- The objective of Policy H6 is that rural dwellings do not lose their traditionality through over extension. This application conflicts with those objectives.
- The report of the application only considers one part of policy DES 1. The justification is that the windows proposed will be for uninhabitable rooms and that there is sufficient distance between the properties. However, it was considered that these two properties already have overlooking issues and approving this application will exacerbate this issue.
- The local Development Plan (LDP) and Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) are for guidance. The local Member does not consider that this application is compliant with policy EP1 of the LDP.
- The report of the application does not adequately address noise and light pollution that the neighbouring property will be affected by should this application be approved.
- The report of the application indicates that the first-floor extension will not give rise to unacceptable noise. However, the extension is just one part of this

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

application. There has been no consideration regarding the car parking spaces. This is allowed under permitted development rights, but it is still part of this application, and the Committee must give consideration to the effect this will have on neighbouring properties. Additional vehicles throughout the day and night will exacerbate noise and light pollution given its proximity to the cottage.

- Planning Policy Wales (PPW) 11 addresses noise pollution and must be complied with. Amenity must be protected.
- As the car parking spaces form a part of this application it is considered that this matter is not compliant with PPW 11 or EP1 of the LDP.
- Condition 4 is welcomed. However, the condition could be stronger to ensure that there is a net biodiversity gain. A root system plan should be considered for existing established trees on the site.
- Adequate parking provision already exists at the front of the property.
- Approval of the application would result in overdevelopment of the site in the open countryside.
- The local Member could not support approval of the application as it was considered not to be compliant with local and national planning policies.

The Development Management Area Team Manager responded as follows:

- The increase in development relates to the first-floor addition and what the visual impact would be in the wider context. The extension can be seen from several public vantage points. However, the issue is whether the increase in volume of that property in its setting affects the landscape character. The Planning Department's view is that the additional impact created by the extension is acceptable.
- The privacy distance is around 40 metres between properties which exceeds the general guidance.
- Aside from this application, the applicant would be entitled to exercise permitted development rights for a greater area of hard landscaping unrestricted by some of the conditions for permitted development to hard surfacing to the front of the dwelling.
- In terms of noise and air pollution generated by the development, there will be an element of disruption during construction works. However, longer term, light nuisance or air pollution caused by the development would remain one dwelling house. The first-floor extension is not considered to exacerbate that use to an extent that it would cause harm.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

- The site is not located within a conservation area. None of the trees are protected by an individual group Tree Preservation Order (TPO). The applicant is entitled to carry out hard landscaping works to the rear separately to this application.

Mr. S. Baldwin, objecting to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The objector's family have lived here for 300 years, and he has also lived here all of his life. The objector's house belonged to his grandfather, and he has undertaken renovation work on it during the previous four years.
- The objector purposely kept his property to an appropriate size to the plot in which it is located and to use appropriate materials.
- Celebration Cottage has had four extensions which have doubled the size of the property. There is an issue of common sense and of contextual over development.
- The current size of the house in proportion to the plot and accommodating the contextual aspect, there has also been a pool house added to the site in the last 12 months.
- It was noted that under permitted development rights the site could be covered with any material chosen by the property owner. However, this would not address their right to how they chose to use it.
- The history of this application is not straightforward. The previous application was subject to a judicial review which caused extreme stress and loss of work to the objector.
- The application was put forward to a judicial review. The consent order submitted today which was not just procedurally based and Monmouthshire County Council chose not to defend that for a range of reasons.
- The impact and character will impact the local countryside. It is not just that it can be seen from the road, but it is about the green and verdant landscape in which the objector's family has lived for 300 years.
- No other house in the area has been extended to this proportion and it was considered that common sense should prevail.
- Contextual overdevelopment is key and it is hard for the objector to live closely to the site in which his grandfather had lived, causing stress to the objector over a long period of time.
- The application will impact the objector's amenity via noise and light pollution at various times throughout the day and night. The property already has and is able

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

to accommodate three to four parking spaces and could already accommodate a further two more. The marginal benefit of having three more parking spaces at the rear of the property would substantially damage the amenity of the objector.

- The Community Council commented and objected to both applications.
- The objector questioned the impartiality of the Planning Department regarding the two applications for this site.

Mr. P. Musker, applicant's agent, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- This application has been the subject of extended and detailed scrutiny.
- There are no new windows to habitable rooms within the proposal that are facing the property known as the Cottage.
- Windows within the proposal to the first floor and facing east are at 90° to the rear of the neighbouring property and 46.43 metres distant. These are not habitable rooms but only serve to provide light to the first-floor landing and stairwell.
- Due to the acute angle no visual aspect can possibly be achieved in the direction of the Cottage.
- The adopted Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) states that a minimum of 21 metres between directly facing habitable windows should be achieved. The only habitable window facing the Cottage is within the existing ground floor of the application property and is 40.52 metres distant. This represents almost 100% increase over the minimum requirement and sits with the adopted SPG.
- Under the criteria of Policy H6 a volume calculation is required which has been provided and concludes a percentage increase over the existing dwelling of 23.831%.
- Policy H6 provides a target increase of 30% as a guideline rising to 50% if no harmful intrusive impact can be established and that there is an enhancement in the appearance of the existing dwelling.
- The application has demonstrated that the proposal sits within the criteria of Policy H6 as outlined in the report of the application.
- The Highways Department has no objection to the application. However, the application has amended the block plan and layout by reducing the spaces to three, handling the layout away from the boundary adjacent to the Cottage and agreed to plant enhancements to reduce the impact on the eastern boundary.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

- Existing trees will remain to compliment the intended enhancements that will be agreed via condition.
- The pool house sits approximately nine metres away from the rear of the host dwelling and is the subject of an approved certificate of lawful development.
- The amended dormer to the rear of the host dwelling is an upgrade and an amendment to an existing dormer window. A measurement assessment has been undertaken and has been deemed within the bounds of permitted development.
- The Committee was asked to consider approval of the application as outlined in the report.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- House sizes within the countryside vary.
- The peak of the roof when completed will only be in the region of 18 inches above the hedge.
- It was considered that any potential noise pollution from additional vehicles would be minimal.
- The ongoing development does not look intrusive or out of character for a dwelling in the open countryside.
- It was considered that the application meets the requirements and material considerations outlined in the report.
- An additional condition could be considered that the three first floor windows on the eastern elevation of the first-floor extension be fixed pane and obscured glazing.

It was proposed by County Councillor M. Powell and seconded by County Councillor J. Butler that application DM/2023/00550 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition that the three first floor windows on the eastern elevation of the first-floor extension be fixed pane and obscured glazing.

County Councillor McKenna was unable to vote on this application due to having technical issues with her Microsoft Teams connection and was not deemed present for the whole of the discussion on this matter. She therefore abstained from voting.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm

Upon being put to the vote the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	11
Against approval	-	1
Abstentions	-	2

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2023/00550 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition that the three first floor windows on the eastern elevation of the first-floor extension be fixed pane and obscured glazing.

**4. Application DM/2022/00473 - Proposal of 7 mews cottages to replace Hebron Hall, a disused Pentecostal chapel and community room positioned off Monnow Street in Monmouth. Proposed removal of an existing garage. Creation of a new public through route from Monnow Street to Howell's Place. Pentecostal Church, Monnow Street, Monmouth, NP25 3EQ**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was presented with a recommendation for refusal for the reason outlined in the report.

The local Member for Town ward attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Monmouth town centre is following a declining trend like all high streets as people are increasingly shopping online.
- The town has several empty buildings that require renovation.
- Hebron Hall has been empty for at least a decade and is attracting antisocial behaviour. The hall is currently in a state of disrepair.
- This scheme makes use of a vacant plot in a positive way on the high street.
- The development has been planned sensitively and is supported by or has received no objections from surrounding neighbours.
- The application provides housing, two of which are affordable housing units.
- A walkway will be provided bringing footfall to the high street.
- The local Member disagrees with Natural Resources Wales (NRW) regarding its view of this application. It was considered that TAN 15 has been met and the flood risk is managed to acceptable level.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm

- A 1 in 100-year flood risk has been mitigated by having the living accommodation located on the first floor.
- This development is considered to be safer than most other nearby buildings and houses that are located in the C1 zone that have ground floor accommodation.
- The local Member asked the Planning Committee to consider supporting the application. If it is refused, then it would be unlikely that any development would be able to be undertaken at this location.
- Monmouth Town Council had been minded to support the application.

The applicant, Mr. M. Hall attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- Hebron Mews proposes an infill development for the brownfield site occupied by Hebron Hall.
- It is a strategically important site which spans from Monnow Street to Waitrose car park and beyond that to Chippenham Fields.
- A scheme was designed to respond to the site's many constraints and a simple terrace of modern mews cottages was considered to be a convincing use of the site.
- A cobbled thoroughfare would provide access for the homes while establishing a new public link from the high street.
- The buildings use quality brick, a rhythmic roofline, and colourful doors to create a durable addition to the townscape.
- Historically, a mews would provide accommodation for horses and carriages on the ground floor with living accommodation above. A 21<sup>st</sup> Century equivalent is being proposed.
- Local amenities are a short walk away enabling a single car per household to be a sustainable proposition.
- The two bedroomed homes incorporate covered outdoor terraces connecting to open plan living spaces on the first floor with bedrooms placed above on the top storey.
- Complex but flexible layouts have been created providing very liveable homes. Two of the seven homes will be affordable housing.
- A number of individual concerns have been raised by specialist consultees. Overall, the Planning department has been satisfied that the scheme provides a well thought through and socially responsible solution within Monmouth



## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

Conservation area. Over the course of several meetings, it had been identified that Hebron Mews would be recommended for approval were it not for an objection by Natural Resources Wales (NRW) on flooding risk grounds.

- Monmouth Flood defences mean that the site is protected against a 1 in 100 year event. However, modelling a 25% overage to predict for climate change indicates the town's current flood defences would overtop and the site would flood. Over 500 acres of Monmouth would be under water at that point.
- In the event of overtopping, on site flood water has been modelled peaking between 0.9 metres and 2.1 metres in depth. That is well below the 2.45 metre level of the proposed living accommodation. Considered in isolation, garaging and storage have low vulnerability to flooding making them an acceptable form of development for the site's ground level.
- Hebron Mews will be far more resilient than neighbouring homes and businesses.
- NRW makes no distinction between the site's use at ground level and upper floors. The entire development has been categorised as highly vulnerable and objects on that basis. Taking this approach stymies any equivalent development within central Monmouth.
- Refusal of this scheme would prevent any infill development across 500 acres of the town. Market towns need to evolve with places to live as well as to shop.
- The applicant's agent requested that the Committee considers approval of the application with a view to rejuvenating the site.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The site has never flooded.
- On balance, it is unlikely that the site will flood to over two metres in height. If this did occur half of Monmouth would be under water.
- The applicant has mitigated flood risk by designing the living area to be above 2.4 metres and be located on the first floor.
- There is a current housing shortage in Monmouthshire. This scheme will provide 7 new houses in Monmouth with two of the properties being affordable housing.
- Development on this site will enhance the area.
- The proposed new public route would be welcomed by local people adding another access point between Monnow Street and the car park.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

- The site is close to several car parks so parking provision would not be an issue.
- This is a much-needed scheme within Monmouth.

The Head of Planning responded, as follows:

- TAN 15 does refer to locating people within the flood risk zone. It is recognised that additional pressures could be placed on emergency services in the event of a flood. It was considered that the tolerance levels of TAN 15 in this case would be exceeded.
- Should the Committee consider that the planning benefits outweigh the risk to residents and supported approval of the application against officers' recommendation then officers would notify Natural Resources Wales (NRW) accordingly. A set of conditions would then be prepared by officers which would be presented to the Planning Delegation Panel. It was noted that NRW could impose additional conditions and could also ask Welsh Government to call in the application.

The Development Management Area Team Manager informed the Committee:

- The access road within the site has been designed to be a shared cobbled surface to encourage people to walk from Monnow Street to the car park.
- The garages will have roller shut doors.
- The air source heat pumps are located at a low level and are screened providing some noise attenuation. If located at a higher level, they would be more visually intrusive and potentially noisier to the occupants or other neighbours.
- If the application was approved conditions would need to be considered by the Delegation Panel which would include matters relating to ecology, lighting and a construction traffic management plan. Maintaining the garages in perpetuity could also be considered.
- There would be a full documented photographic record of the existing building before any development takes place.
- A method statement for demolition could also be included with consideration of the reuse of fabric within the building.
- A flood rescue plan has been submitted as part of the application. The applicant has committed to providing a flood defence system which could be included as a condition.
- Currently, the phosphate levels are considered to be a betterment. However, a Grampian condition could be applied.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm

It was proposed by County Councillor J. McKenna and seconded by County Councillor A. Webb to approve application DM/2022/00473 subject to a Section 106 agreement and to agree conditions to be applied via the Delegation Panel. Natural Resources Wales to be contacted to notify them of the resolution to approve the application.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	13
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved to approve application DM/2022/00473 subject to a Section 106 agreement and to agree conditions to be applied via the Delegation Panel. Natural Resources Wales to be contacted to notify them of the resolution to approve the application.

#### **5. Application DM/2023/00302 - Conversion of garage and linking to main residence to form additional accommodation. 75 St Lawrence Park, Chepstow, NP16 6DQ**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report.

The local Member for Mount Pleasant addressed the Committee via Video recording and outlined the following points:

- The key element of the contention is reflected in paragraph 6.5.1 of the report of the application. The Committee is required to disaggregate this matter which is subject to a further application.
- The applicant has informed the local Member that they have no intention of extending their child-minding business. However, there is a level of scepticism from neighbours that this is the case. Therefore, several residents have objected to the application and raised concerns.
- The local Member asked whether consideration of the application could be deferred until other matters have been resolved.
- The local Member has been contacted by several residents post report publication highlighting what they perceive as factual inaccuracies contained within the report, namely:
  - Chepstow Town Council's response was not formally recognised that was submitted on 15<sup>th</sup> June 2023.
  - Supporting correspondence in 5.2 of the report was not published.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

- Whether the level of direct consultation that affected neighbours was sufficient as outlined in 5.2 of the report. Neighbours had informed the local Member that they had not received formal consultation letters.
- The local Member considered that deferral of the application should be considered if the Committee concluded that there were evidence gaps and due process had not been undertaken.
- The report states in 6.2 that there will be an amenity impact. It was considered that the Committee needs to satisfy itself how much of a potential impact this might have and whether it is reasonable and proportionate.
- Concerns have been raised regarding the over development of the plot and massing. The Committee needs to satisfy itself whether the amount of proposed development and its intensity is comparable with existing uses and whether the footprint is balanced, sensitive and in keeping with neighbouring properties.
- The proposal needs to maintain reasonable levels of privacy and amenity of occupiers of neighbouring properties, does not lead to amenity infringement, loss of light and overshadowing.
- St. Lawrence Park is a dense estate, and this cul-de-sac has limited access for vehicle circulation and parking.
- Concerns had been raised by the Highways Department which have been maintained despite alterations to the proposals submitted.
- There was a need to identify whether relaxing parking standards would adversely affect the safety and efficient operation of the highway system and where they would afford satisfactory provision for access circulation and parking.

Mr. P. Healy-Jones, objecting to the application, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The project description in the report as an amendment extension to an existing residential property is considered to be fundamentally flawed.
- The Local Planning Authority's decision to disaggregate this application with the property being run as a fulltime nursery is a conflict of interest. This has been verified by the Enforcement Department inviting an application for change of use.
- It was considered that if this application is legitimate in its intended purpose for residential use only, its outcome should be delayed until the change of use application is determined.
- The size of the property does not require an additional staircase and an independent front door within 20 feet of existing doors.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

- It was considered that this was an application for a separate nursery annex apart from the main dwelling.
- Chepstow Town Council has objected which is significant as this application is only meant to be an extension to an existing garage.
- It was considered that the report incorrectly states that direct neighbour consultation has occurred, However, only property number 74 received written notice despite three properties being directly affected.
- With regard to design and amenity the objector's original comments demonstrate that the proposals are overbearing in terms of over development, plot density, streetscape and context but these have been disregarded.
- It is unorthodox for planners to suggest that if the proposal is located on a boundary and the level of overlooking in the area is high that it is acceptable to make it worse and further reduce amenity, we would normally experience the opposite in the planning process.
- The parking and highways response is irregular. Because parking guidelines designed to improve parking established in 2013 cannot be applied retrospectively it gives licence to approve proposals that aggravate an already inadequate provision. This approach disregards all best practice design guidelines that existed prior to 2013. The substantiation in this instance for using Future Wales aspiration and local transport is impractical. If retrospective guidelines cannot be applied to older properties neither can Future Wales. It should only be applied to new developments.
- If the proposals did not include shared driveway access, road safety issues, increased on street parking located on a blind bend, then one space would still not be enough. However, they do and is the view of the Highways Department.
- When considering day to day parking at property number 75 with vehicles dropping off and collecting children, nursery staff parking and parents drop off and collection, the conclusion to disregard the Highways Department and local residents is difficult to comprehend.
- Residents consider the recommendations of the report has disregarded local concerns and put the planning process in jeopardy.
- The risk of potential exposure to future reviews is not insignificant if it was later demonstrated that this accommodation was being used as a nursery annex should this application and the change of use be approved.

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

### **Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm**

Mr. A. Cox, the applicant's representative, attended the meeting by invitation of the Chair and outlined the following points:

- The application is not to expand the child-minding business but to provide additional family living space and to create a better quality of life.
- To provide additional living space to accommodate an elderly family member.

The Development Management Area Team Manager informed the Committee:

- Chepstow Town Council's comments have been presented to Committee Members.
- Direct letters were sent to third parties as well as the usual site notice being erected.
- With regard to deferral of the application pending consideration of a separate application for change of use, the lawful use of the building is that of a single dwelling house. The extension size and scale as a domestic extension can be considered on its merits. A separate application has been received but this will go through its own planning process and may be presented to Planning Committee at a future date for consideration.
- There is a small increase in footprint to the dwelling, linking the small gap between the dwelling and the garage. The extension has been significantly reduced and does not represent an over development of the plot.
- Privacy issues, overbearing and energy impact have been improved via negotiation. There would be a degree of impact but not to an unacceptable level.
- Future Wales and PPW 11 are live planning policies and are a material consideration for the determination of applications presented at today's meeting. Current planning policy has been applied to this application. The highways issues have not been disregarded but have been carefully considered and the view is that from a highway safety perspective, there is not an unacceptable harm to wider and local highway safety.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- A condition requiring rear first floor windows of the extension could be fixed pane obscure glazed.
- The shared driveway is wide enough to accommodate two vehicles.

It was proposed by County Councillor F. Bromfield and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DM/2023/00302 be approved subject to the conditions

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm

outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition requiring rear first floor windows of the extension to be fixed pane obscure glazed.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	10
Against approval	-	2
Abstentions	-	1

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2023/00302 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to an additional condition requiring rear first floor windows of the extension to be fixed pane obscure glazed.

#### **6. Application DM/2021/02070 - Reserved Matters consent pursuant to the approval of outline planning permission ref: DM/2018/00769 for Outline development of up to 45 dwellings. Land at Chepstow Road, Raglan**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to final confirmation from Natural Resources Wales (NRW) that the development would not have an adverse impact on water quality within the river Usk catchment.

The Head of Planning informed the Committee that the permit review at Raglan Treatment works is the first in Wales undertaken by Natural Resources Wales (NRW). NRW is using this application as a test case.

The local Member for Raglan, attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair, outlined the following points:

- The local Member is in favour of the proposed development.
- The development will afford opportunities to local residents of Raglan.
- Raglan residents have raised some areas of concern regarding sewerage. There have been some long-standing issues regarding this matter and it was hoped that these issues would be addressed before development takes place.
- Flooding on the roads can be severe and it was hoped that TAN 15 guidelines had been used to assess and address the flood risk in this area.

The Development Services Manager responded as follows:

- Welsh Water has advised that there is no objection to this scheme and has not identified any infrastructure issues that require improvement in relation to the proposed development.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm

- The flooding issues have been properly investigated. A plan has been established which identifies the southern part of the site being in the flood zone. This area needs to be retained as a flooding area and biodiversity habitat.
- There will not be any negative impacts to existing dwellings from this development.
- The proposed development will be SuDS Approval Body (SAB) compliant.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, the following points were noted:

- The proposed development was welcomed.
- Directly opposite Brookland's Lodge there is a National Speed Limit sign exiting the area. Going into the area the speed limit is 30mph. It was suggested that an extension of 20mph zoning could be looked at when entering the area.
- Concern was expressed regarding having a footpath at this location due to the bend in the road and the speed of vehicles.
- A sum of £3132 per dwelling towards the provision of recreation / community facilities in Raglan has been secured as well as £30,000 to pump prime and enhance the local bus service including route numbers 60 and 82.
- There will be additional Green Infrastructure (GI) to enhance the site and create more ecological corridors for wildlife.
- Benches will be located along the public open space. Raglan Community Council has already installed benches at various locations within the area.

It was proposed by County Councillor D. Rooke and seconded by County Councillor A. Easson that application DM/2021/02070 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to final confirmation from Natural Resources Wales (NRW) that the development would not have an adverse impact on water quality within the river Usk catchment.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DM/2021/02070 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to final confirmation from Natural Resources Wales



## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm

(NRW) that the development would not have an adverse impact on water quality within the river Usk catchment.

#### **7. Application DM/2022/01376 - Conversion of the former convent building into 4no. self-contained apartments (C3 Class). 151 Park Crescent, Abergavenny, Monmouthshire NP7 5TN**

We considered the report of the application and late correspondence which was recommended for approval subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 legal agreement. Also, that two further conditions be added, namely:

- The retention of the existing windows to the front of the building.
- A method statement be submitted for the repair on the lintels on the property frontage.

In noting the detail of the application, the following points were identified:

- The additional conditions were welcomed.
- In response to a request for an additional condition to upgrade the windows to Heritage double glazing, it was noted that officers will have the ability to manage any changes needed to replace the windows and would be in keeping with the wider conservation area. This will provide officers with a level of control in this matter.
- There is sufficient space at the front of the development for multiple residents to store bicycles.

It was proposed by County Councillor D. Rooke and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DM/2022/01376 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal agreement. Also, that two further conditions be added, namely:

- The retention of the existing windows to the front of the building.
- A method statement be submitted for the repair on the lintels on the property frontage.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval	-	12
Against approval	-	0
Abstentions	-	0

The proposition was carried.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at The Council Chamber, County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA with remote attendance on Tuesday, 4th July, 2023 at 2.00 pm

We resolved that application DM/2022/01376 be approved subject to the conditions outlined in the report and subject to a Section 106 Legal agreement. Also, that two further conditions be added, namely:

- The retention of the existing windows to the front of the building.
- A method statement be submitted for the repair on the lintels on the property frontage.

#### **8. FOR INFORMATION - The Planning Inspectorate - Appeals Decisions Received:**

##### **8.1. Vern Cottage, 16 Castle Parade, Usk**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit that had been held at Vern Cottage, 16 Castle Parade, Usk on 31<sup>st</sup> May 2023.

We noted that the appeal had been allowed on ground (a) and the Notice was quashed. Planning permission was granted on the application deemed to have been made under section 177(5) of the Act for the development already carried out, namely the removal of a chimney in the Conservation Area at Vern Cottage, 16 Castle Parade, Usk NP15 1AA referred to in the Notice.

**The meeting ended at 5.20 pm.**